SUPERIOR COURT OF NEW JERSEY

LAW DIVISION: UNION COUNTY

CRIMINAL - 97-02-00123

STATE OF NEW JERSEY,

Stenographic Transcript

of

vs.

Miranda Motion

MARVIN MATHIS,

Defendant,

Place: Union County Courthouse

2 Broad Street,

Elizabeth, New Jersey,

Date: June 9, 1998.

BEFORE:

HON. JOHN F. MALONE, J.S.C.,

TRANSCRIPT ORDERED BY:

OFFICE OF THE PUBLIC DEFENDER
Appellate Section

APPEARANCES:

WILLIAM KOLANO, ESQ. Assistant Prosecutor, Union County, For the State,

WALTER E. FLORCZAK, ESQ. (Florczak & Florczak) Attorney for the Defendant,

B. PETER SLUSAREK, C.S.R., XI00291 Official Court Reporter Union County Courthouse Elizabeth, New Jersey, 07207

|    |                        |      | 2 |
|----|------------------------|------|---|
| 1  | WITNESSES INDEX        |      | ÷ |
| 2  |                        |      |   |
| 3  |                        | PAGE |   |
| 4  | MICHAEL BROWN          |      |   |
| 5  | Direct By Mr. Kolano   | 05   |   |
| 6  | Cross By Mr. Florczak  | 10   |   |
| 7  |                        |      |   |
| 8  |                        |      |   |
| 9  | THOMAS KOCZUR          |      |   |
| 10 | Direct By Mr. Kolano   | 13   |   |
| 11 | Cross By Mr. Florczak  | 42   |   |
| 12 |                        |      |   |
| 13 |                        |      |   |
| 14 | LINDA MATHIS           | 65   |   |
| 15 |                        |      |   |
| 16 | MARVIN MATHIS          |      |   |
| 17 | Direct By Mr. Florczak | 72   |   |
| 18 | Cross By Mr. Kolano    | 83   |   |
| 19 |                        |      |   |
| 20 |                        |      |   |
| 21 | ·                      |      |   |
| 22 |                        |      |   |
| 23 |                        |      |   |
| 24 |                        |      |   |
| 25 | ·<br>·                 |      |   |
|    | •                      |      |   |

3 JUNE 9, 1998. 1 MR. KOLANO: S-36 is statement of Sharlama Brooks, 2 3 1-24-96. S-37 is Marvin Mathis' Miranda, 5:45 p.m. S-38 is Marvin Mathis' Miranda 12:07 p.m. 5 S-39 is consent to search, 538 Magnolia Avenue. 6 7 S-40 statement Marvin Mathis, 1-20-96, 6:50 p.m. S-41 is statement Marvin Mathis 1-24-96 2:30 p.m. 8 S-36 statement Sharlama Brooks. 9 This is for the Miranda hearing only. 10 11 THE COURT: Matter of State versus Marvin Mathis, indictment 97-02-00123. 12 Counsel, appearances for the record. 13 MR. KOLANO: William Kolano, assistant prosecutor, for 14 the state. 15 Your Honor, I will be assisted during this trial by 16 summer intern student at law school who will be at counsel 17 table, with court's permission. 18 THE COURT: Yes, certainly. 19 MR. FLORCZAK: Good morning. 20 21 Walter Florczak from Marvin Mathis, who is present. THE COURT: Based on my discussion with counsel, I 22 23 understand there is a need for a Miranda hearing in connection 24 with this matter. So before we embark upon any jury selection

we can attend to that.

Mr. Kolano, are you ready to proceed on on that? 1 MR. KOLANO: I am, your Honor. 2 State calls Michael Brown. 3 MICHAEL BROWN, S R. 4 W. Sworn as a witness and testified as follows: 5 DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. KOLANO: 6 7 By whom are you employed? Elizabeth Police Department. 8 How long have you been employed with the Elizabeth 9 Q. Police Department? 10 Sixteen years. 11 Back in January of 1996 what assignment did you have? 12 I was signed to Elizabeth High School. 13 Could you please give the court a general idea of what 14 your assignment was as a police officer assigned to the 15 Elizabeth High School? 16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

I was assigned in a plain clothes detail as a detective to

Back January 24, 1996 how long had you been assigned

And was there another detective or another police

officer who was assigned there on a, quote, permanent basis?

really like, how can I say, intermingle with the kids, you

had a problem they would come to me.

About two years.

0.

to the high school detail, approximately?

know, not in uniform so they wouldn't be intimidated so if they

BROWN - DIRECT BY KOLANO 5 1 Α. Yes. 2 Q. Who was that? Detective Garcia. 3 4 And as a result of your occupying that position did 5 you come to gain the trust of many of the students? 6 Yes. 7 Was your position a traditional police officer versus Q. bad guy position or something different? 8 9 A. It was more of a, to give the kids, you know, a reason to come to the officers so that they wouldn't be intimidated, so 10 we weren't in uniform. We just like basically dress and 11 12 participated, you know, with the kids. 13 Q. Was this part of what we now come to refer to as community policing type of activity? 14 15 Yes. 16 On January 24, 1996, did you have occasion to come Q. into contact with a person by the name of Sharlama Brooks? 17 Yes. 18 Α. 19 Q. And did Sharlama Brooks --20 Did you know Janice Sutton at that time? 21 I had met her. You know, dealing with all the different Α. schools, you know, we have, we passed. 22 Did Sharlama Brooks have some conversation that you 23 Q. were privy to or present for on January 24, 1996? 24 Partially. 25 Α.

#### BROWN - DIRECT BY KOLANO

- Q. As a result of that conversation or any direction you
- 2 | got from superiors at police headquarters did you come to meet
- 3 | a person by the name of Marvin Mathis?
- 4 | A. Yes.

1

- 5 Q. Was Marvin a student at the school at the time?
- 6 A. Yes.
- Q. Which particular school was he at at that time, if you
- 8 | recall?
- 9 A. Jefferson.
- 10 Q. And there come a point in time where you actually met
- 11 | Mathis January 24, 1996 in person?
- 12 | A. Yes.
- Q. And please tell us what happened when you met Mr.
- 14 | Mathis and what happened thereafter?
- 15 | A. Okay. We were called by Detective Koczur to see if Marvin
- 16 | Mathis was in school. So, you know we, it was common for us to
- 17 go around if one of the detectives or one of the officers
- 18 | wanted to speak to anybody from the school to go over to Jeff
- 19 because that's where we looked at the schedule, and that's
- where he was at. So we went over to Jeff, and we met with him.
- 21 | Q. When you say we who do you mean?
- 22 A. Detective Garcia and myself.
- Q. Were you both in plain clothes?
- 24 A. Yes.

25

Q. Did you dress similar to the way you dress today, suit





|    | BROWN - DIRECT BY KOLANO 7                                  |
|----|---|
| 1  | and tie situation?  |
| 2  | A. No. Jeans, sneakers, T-shirt, sweat shirts.              |
| 3  | Q. Did you have your gun displayed?                         |
| 4  | A. No.  |
| 5  | Q. And when you met with Marvin Mathis what did you ask     |
| 6  | him to do, if anything?                                     |
| 7  | A. Would he come over to police headquarters because one of |
| 8  | the detectives wanted to speak to him.                      |
| 9  | Q. What was his response to that?                           |
| 10 | A. Said okay.   |
| 11 | Q. Did you force him to go to police headquarters?          |
| 12 | A. No.  |
| 13 | Q. Did you or Officer Garcia, Detective Garcia threaten     |
| 14 | him?  |
| 15 | A. No.  |
| 16 | Q. Was any force, coercion, or threats made on Mr. Mathis   |
| 17 | by you or Officer Garcia?                                   |
| 18 | A. No.  |
| 19 | Q. Did he go voluntarily?                                   |
| 20 | A. Yes.   |
| 21 | Q. Was he placed under formal arrest by you?                |
| 22 | A. No.  |
| 23 | Q. Was he handcuffed?                                       |
| 24 | A. No.  |
| 25 | Q. Was his freedom of movement restrained in any way?       |
| ļ  |   |

#### BROWN - DIRECT BY KOLANO 8 1 NO. How would you describe the exchange between you and 2 Q. Mr. Mathis -- cordial, hostile, friendly, sociable? 3 It was sociable. It was, you know, we always go over, you know, get the kids. So we never, you know, had any like run in 5 or anything like that with him. 6 Did he express any misgivings or hesitation or balk at 7 Q. the idea of going to meet with the detective? Not to my memory. 9 And was he actually brought to police headquarters? 10 Q. 11 Α. Yes. Q. By whom? 12 Detective Garcia and myself. 13 In what type of car? 14 Q. One of the unmarked. 15 While he was transported was he handcuffed? 16 Q. No. 17 Α. Was he searched prior to getting into the police car? 18 Q. I don't remember. Because he wasn't under arrest, so --19 And during the ride to headquarters did you threaten 20 him or force him or coerce him in any way? 21 A. No. 22 Did he at that time express any, any reservations 23 Q. about going? 24 A. Not to my knowledge. 25

|    | BROWN - DIRECT BY KOLANO 9                                    |
|----|---|
| 1  | Q. In short, was it a voluntary trip that was made by him     |
| 2  | as far as you could tell?                                     |
| 3  | A. Yes.   |
| 4  | Q. Once you got to headquarters what did you do with Mr.      |
| 5  | Mathis?   |
| 6  | A. We brought him upstairs to Detective Koczur, and that was  |
| 7  | it.   |
| 8  | Q. And then you left?   |
| 9  | A. Yes.   |
| 10 | Q. And did that end your involvement with Marvin Mathis?      |
| 11 | A. Yes.   |
| 12 | MR. KOLANO: Nothing further.                                  |
| 13 | THE COURT: Mr. Florczak.                                      |
| 14 | CROSS EXAMINATION BY MR. FLORCZAK:                            |
| 15 | Q. Detective Is it officer or detective? I am sorry.          |
| 16 | A. Doesn't matter.  |
| 17 | Q. Doesn't matter. Okay.                                      |
| 18 | Detective, what time did you see Mr. Mathis that morning?     |
| 19 | A. I can't remember exact time.                               |
| 20 | Q. Do you remember what period, whether it was first          |
| 21 | period, second period, or anything else?                      |
| 22 | A. No.  |
| 23 | Q. Did you go to his classroom?                               |
| 24 | A. I think someone called and he came, you know, to the       |
| 25 | guidance or something. I can't remember a hundred percent, so |
|    |   |

10 BROWN - CROSS BY FLORCZAK I won't even --1 So you don't remember who got him out of his classroom 2 Q. and what room --3 Whether he was brought to vice-principal's room or guidance 4 counselor or anything else, you don't remember? 5 I don't remember who got him out of his classroom. 6 And you didn't write any report on this, did you? 7 Q. No. A. 8 So this is what, two and a half years ago. Your 9 memory is not clear as to what was said when he was brought, 10 wherever you were? 11 A. Right. 12 Detective Koczur informed you or your partner that 13 they wanted him down at the station, is that correct? 14 Yes. 15 Α. So that is it possible that when he came to wherever 16 Q. you were you told him you have to come down the station with 17 us, isn't that true? 18 19 A. Yes. And he was taken down to the station? 20 ο. Yes. 21 Α. MR. FLORCZAK: I have nothing. 22 REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. KOLANO: 23 That he had to go, or did he express willingness to 24 Q. 25 go?

|    | BROWN - CROSS BY FLORCZAK 11                                |  |  |
|----|---|--|--|
| 1  | A. Well, like I said, there was nothing threatening manner. |  |  |
| 2  | We told him one of the detectives wanted to speak to him.   |  |  |
| 3  | Q. You asked him if he would go?                            |  |  |
| 4  | A. Go to headquarters with us.                              |  |  |
| 5  | Q. And he said Yes?   |  |  |
| 6  | A. Yes.   |  |  |
| 7  | MR. FLORCZAK: I object to the leading nature of the         |  |  |
| 8  | question.   |  |  |
| 9  | THE COURT: Sustained.                                       |  |  |
| 10 | Q. What did he say when you said, Would you go to           |  |  |
| 11 | headquarters?   |  |  |
| 12 | MR. FLORCZAK: Judge, assuming that's what the officer       |  |  |
| 13 | asked him.  |  |  |
| 14 | MR. KOLANO: He already testified to that.                   |  |  |
| 15 | MR. FLORCZAK: Prosecutor testified to that; the             |  |  |
| 16 | officer didn't.   |  |  |
| 17 | THE COURT: I will sustain objection. Rephrase the           |  |  |
| 18 | question.   |  |  |
| 19 | MR. KOLANO: No further questions.                           |  |  |
| 20 | MR. FLORCZAK: I have nothing further, judge.                |  |  |
| 21 | Thank you.  |  |  |
| 22 | THE COURT: Officer, you may step down. You are              |  |  |
| 23 | excused. Watch your step. There is a step there.            |  |  |
| 24 | MR. KOLANO: Thomas Koczur.                                  |  |  |
| 25 |   |  |  |

|    | KOCZUR - DIRECT BY KOLANO 12                                  |  |
|----|---|--|
| 1  | THOMAS KOCZUR   |  |
| 2  | Sworn as a witness and testified as follows:                  |  |
| 3  | DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. KOLANO:                             |  |
| 4  | Q. By whom are you employed?                                  |  |
| 5  | A. By the City of Elizabeth.                                  |  |
| 6  | Q. In what capacity?  |  |
| 7  | A. Presently I am detective assigned to the detective bureau. |  |
| 8  | Q. How long with the detective bureau?                        |  |
| 9  | A. Ten years.   |  |
| 10 | Q. And how long have you been a police officer?               |  |
| 11 | A. Twenty-one.  |  |
| 12 | Q. And on January 24th, 1996, did you continue your           |  |
| 13 | involvement with the investigation into a death that occurred |  |
| 14 | of Antonio Saraiva?   |  |
| 15 | A. Yes, I did.  |  |
| 16 | Q. On that occasion, 24th of January, 1996, did you have      |  |
| 17 | occasion to have some contact with Sharlama Brooks?           |  |
| 18 | A. Yes.   |  |
| 19 | Q. How was your first contact with the name of Sharlama       |  |
| 20 | Brooks?   |  |
| 21 | A. I was informed by Detective Lieutenant Gary Lewis that     |  |
| 22 | there might be a possible eyewitness involved in this case.   |  |
| 23 | Q. Do you recall what time it was that you learned this       |  |
| 24 | information on the 24th of January, 1996?                     |  |
| 25 | A. Approximately ten a.m.                                     |  |
|    |   |  |

## KOCZUR - DIRECT BY KOLANO

Q. And when you received this information at

2 | approximately ten a.m. what was done to meet with Sharlama

3 Brooks?

4 A. At that time I made arrangements to back then was Captain

5 Mark Kurdula's office, and I used his office to interview

6 | Sharlama Brooks.

Q. And did you come to also know a person by the name

8 | Janice Sutton?

9 A. Yes, I did.

10 Q. Was she present during the interview of Miss Brooks?

11 | A. Yes, she was.

12 Q. I am going to show you what has been marked for

Miranda purposes only S-36 for identification. I ask you to

look at it. Do you recognize that?

15 | A. Yes, I do.

13

14

18

25

16 Q. What is that?

17 A. This is the statement given by Sharlama Brooks on 1-24-96.

Q. What is the start time of that actual written

19 | statement?

20 A. 11:05 a.m.

21 Q. And you were the person who took the statement?

22 A. Yes, I was.

Q. And who was the typist?

24 A. Lydia Martinez.

Q. Prior to your starting this statement at 11:05 a.m.,



KOCZUR - DIRECT BY KOLANO

14

- did you conduct an oral interview of Miss Brooks?
- 2 A. Yes, I did.
- Q. And without going into all of it, you are familiar with this written statement?
- 5 A. Yes.

- Q. Without going into all the details, did she, Miss

  Brooks, tell you pretty much everything in the oral statement

  that she told you in the, that was subsequently recorded in the
- 9 written statement?
- 10 A. Yes, she did.
- 11 Q. And this was all in the presence of Miss Janice
  12 Sutton?
- 13 A. Yes, it was.
- Q. After you learned about Miss Sutton -- about Miss
  Brooks, did you make any phone calls or any arrangements
- 16 regarding Marvin Mathis?
- 17 A. No, I did not.
- 18 Q. Did somebody else?
- 19 A. Yes, they did.
- 20 Q. What was done?
- 21 A. Marvin Mathis was transported from Elizabeth Hgh School to
- 22 the detect bureau.
- Q. Was that at your general request?
- 24 A. No, it was not. That was done even before, well, after, I
- 25 | found out that Marvin Mathis was a possible suspect in this

## KOCZUR - DIRECT BY KOLANO 16 I told him, no, no. 1 2 "Question: Did you ask him? "Answer: I asked him why, but he wasn't straight 3 with me. 4 "Question: What did he say? 5 "Answer: If I tell you are going to black out, so 6 7 just left it at that. "Question: Earlier in your interview you stated to 8 this detective that your boyfriend shot someone by accident, is 9 that correct? 10 11 "Answer: Yes. "Question: When did he tell you this? 12 "Answer: When we were alone by the guidance 13 14 office." Let me stop you here. When you say earlier in this 15 interview you are referring to oral interview? 16 Yes. 17 Α. That would have had to have happened before you 18 Q. started written statement at 11:05 a.m. 19 Yes. 20 Α. Please continue with the next highlighted portion. 21 "Question: In your own words, can you tell me to the best 22 Α. of your recollection the exact words that he used when he told 23 you about the shooting. 24 "Answer: He told me him and his friend were 25

6

7

8

9

10

11

19

20

21

22

25

## KOCZUR - DIRECT BY KOLANO

walking, and I guess they stopped, and the man was bringing out

17

2 his garbage, and I think they got into a little argument, and

Marvin told me he went to just grab the guy, and he said the

4 | gun had went off. I shook my head, I started crying, and I

5 | went to my first class period.

"Question: Besides this detective, members of the Elizabeth Police Department, and members of the Board of

Education, did you discuss this incident with anyone else?

"Answer: No."

- Q. Does Sharlama Brooks sign and swear to the truthfulness of this statement?
- 12 A. Yes, she does.
- Q. Once you started taking this statement did you have to interrupt this statement early on to go meet with someone else?
- 15 A. Yes.
- 16 Q. And who did you meet with?
- 17 A. I was informed that Marvin Mathis was presently seated 18 inside the detective bureau.
  - Q. And do you recall where in the detective bureau he was seated?
    - A. That was a larger conference room.
      - Q. And where did you --
- 23 What did you do when you received this information that
- 24 Marvin Mathis was at headquarters?
  - A. I immediately left the interview room and walked down to





KOCZUR - DIRECT BY KOLANO 18 meet with Marvin Mathis. 1 And was he seated in the conference room? 2 ο. Yes, sir, he was. 3 Q. Was he handcuffed? 4 5 No, he was not. Was he placed under formal arrest? 6 No, he was not. 7 Was he restrained in any way, shape, or form? 8 Q. No, he was not. 9 Tell me what you said to Mr. Marvin Mathis when you 10 saw him seated in the conference room? 11 At that time I informed Marvin Mathis that he is a strong 12 suspect in this case, and Marvin Mathis became very nervous and 13 started to ask me questions. At that time I told him I don't 14 want him asking me anything. I like to do this the right way. 15 And the right way is for me find a guardian or your mother, 16 I told him not to answer any questions until 17 someone of age. his mother was present, not answer any questions if anybody 18 19 asked them until his mother was present. What did you do or direct be done to make sure that 20 his mother or guardian would become present? 21 Myself and Lieutenant Gary Lewis made several phone calls, 22 and we found out that his mother worked at the Elizabeth 23 General Medical Center. At that time arrangements were made to 24 have her picked up from work and brought back to headquarters. 25

#### K0CZUR - DIRECT BY KOLANO 19 Did she -- You did not do the pick up, did you? 1 Q. 2 I continued my statement with Sharlama Brooks. And did you come to learn that Mrs. Mathis, Mathis' 3 Q. mother came to headquarters? 4 5 Yes, she did. And did you meet her? 6 Q. Α. Yes, I did. That was Linda Mathis? Q. 8 Yes, sir, it was. 9 Tell me about your conversation with Linda Mathis 10 after you learned she was at headquarters? 11 I explained to Miss Mathis pretty much same thing I 12 mentioned to her son Marvin, that her son is a very strong 13 suspect in a case where a shooting homicide and robbery took 14 place in the seven hundred block of East Jersey Street. 15 What was her general reaction to hearing that? 16 Q. She seemed a little disappointed and a little upset. 17 once again, she was starting to ask me a lot of questions. 18 And did you outline the procedure that was going to 19 20 take place? Yes, I did. 21 Α. And tell me what happened then. 22 Q. Well, did you then meet Marvin Mathis again? 23 Yes, I did. 24

Where did this meeting take place?

25

Q.

A TOTAL PROPERTY

#### KOCZUR - DIRECT BY KOLANO

1 A. At that time, after I left him first time, he was placed in

- 2 | interview room in the back. Linda Mathis was brought inside
- 3 the conference room again, and Marvin Mathis was brought in
- 4 again. So they were both seated together with myself,
- 5 Detective John Furda, and Detective Gary Lewis inside the
- 6 | conference room.
- 7 Q. At this point you had finished taking your written
- 8 | statement that you identified from Sharlama Brooks?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. And what is the first thing that you did regarding the
- 11 | rights for Marvin Mathis?
- 12 | A. At that time I, I orally and handwrittenly advised him of
- 13 | his Miranda rights.
- 14 | Q. Was he under arrest at that time formally?
- 15 | A. No.
- 16 Q. Was he handcuffed?
- 17 A. No.
- 18 | Q. His mother was present at that time?
- 19 A. Yes.
- 20 Q. Showing you now what has been marked, for Miranda
- 21 | purposes only, S-38 for identification, and I ask you to look
- 22 | at it and indicate whether or not you recognize that?
- 23 | A. Yes, I do.
- 24 | Q. What is that?
- 25 A. This is the advisement of constitutional rights form that





2

3

8

18

25

KOCZUR - DIRECT BY KOLANO

- used on 1/24/96 in regards to reading Marvin Mathis his Miranda rights in the presence of his mother.
  - What time does that start? 0.
- Starts at 12:07 p.m. 4
- Do you recall which clock you used to note that it 5 started 12:07? 6
- No, I don't. 7 Α.
  - Do you wear a watch? Q.
- 9 Α. No, I do not.
- Back then were you wearing a watch? 10
- No, I did not. 11
- Would you please demonstrate for the court exactly how 12 Q. you advised Mr. Mathis in the presence of his mother of his 13
- 14 Miranda rights?
- A. I was seated at the head of the table, and Marvin Mathis 15 and his mother were seated to the right. I read each right 16 aloud, and after reading each right aloud, with his mother and 17 both Marvin Mathis understood each right, I asked Marvin to
- place his initial after each sentence. 19
- Would you please demonstrate. 20
- You have a right to remain silent. Do you understand this 21 right? They indicated to me which they did. If they 22
- understood, then I moved rights form over to them, and they 23
- placed their initials. 24
  - Did Marvin indicate that he understood that right? Q.



# K0CZUR - DIRECT BY KOLANO

1 A. Yes, he did.

Q. Did his mother indicate that she understood that

22

3 | right?

- 4 A. Yes, she did.
- Q. There is an initial after that right or after the line that says Do you understand? Whose initial is that?
- 7 A. Marvin Mathis'.
- 8 Q. Did you watch him initial that?
- 9 A. Yes, I did.
- Q. And he initialed that after you advised him of the
- 11 | right and after he indicated orally to you that he understood
- 12 | the right?
- 13 A. Yes, he did.
- Q. Did that procedure that you just detailed for us hold
- 15 true for each of the subsequent rights there?
- 16 A. Yes, it did.
- Q. And does Marvin Mathis' initial appear after the line
- 18 Do you understand? on each of the rights?
- 19 A. Yes, it does.
- Q. Did he orally indicate following each right that he
- 21 | did understand his rights?
- 22 A. Yes, he did.
- 23 Q. Did his mother Linda Mathis also indicate following
- 24 advisement of each of the rights that she understood each of
- 25 | the rights?





1

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Yes, she did.

2

And please demonstrate for the court what you did whem Q. you got to the waiver portion?

That is, I At that time I read the waiver portion aloud. have read this statement of my rights and I understand what my rights are. I am willing to make a statement and answer questions. No promises or threats have been made to me nor pressure nor coercion of any kind has been used against me.

After I read that to him I asked Marvin Mathis and his mother if they fully understood this portion of the waiver of rights form. They said that they did.

At that time Marvin Mathis was asked to place his name, sign the indicated waiver of rights form, and the previously five read rights; and same true for Linda Mathis, his mother.

And there are some signatures here on this copy.

The first one, whose signature is that? pointing to on the top line?

Marvin Mathis. Α.

Linda Mathis.

And you personally witnessed Marvin Mathis sign this form?

Yes, I did.

You personally witnessed Linda Mathis, his mother, sign this form?

Yes.



|    |               | KOCZUR - DIRECT BY KOLANO 24                             | 1    |
|----|---------------|--|------|
| 1  |               | Q. And at what time is this completed?                   |      |
| 2  | A.            | 12:09.   |      |
| 3  |               | Q. Who signed as the advising officer?                   |      |
| 4  | A.            | That is my signature.                                    |      |
| 5  |               | Q. Whose signature to the left bottom side of your       |      |
| 6  | sig           | nature is that?  |      |
| 7  | A.            | Detective Lieutenant Gary Lewis.                         |      |
| 8  |               | Q. Whose signature on the bottom right?                  |      |
| 9  | A.            | Detective John Furda from Union County Prosecutor's off: | ice  |
| 10 |               | Q. Could you give us the general dimensions of the       |      |
| 11 | con           | ference room?  |      |
| 12 | A.            | I would say they are approximately twelve by twenty.     |      |
| 13 |               | Q. And were all of the police personnel in plain cloth   | hes  |
| 14 | A.            | Yes.   |      |
| 15 |               | Q. Did anyone have their gun displayed, to your          |      |
| 16 | recollection? |  |      |
| 17 | Α.            | Not to my recollection.                                  |      |
| 18 |               | Q. Was any force, threats, or coercion used on Marvin    |      |
| 19 | Mat           | his or his mother in advising him of these rights?       |      |
| 20 | A.            | No.  |      |
| 21 |               | Q. Did he or his mother at any time indicate that the    | У    |
| 22 | did           | not understand any of these rights?                      |      |
| 23 | Α.            | No, they did not.  |      |
| 24 |               | Q. Did either Marvin or his mother ask for an explana    | tion |
| 25 | of            | any of the words or meaning of any of these rights?      |      |
|    | ,             |  |      |

KOCZUR - DIRECT BY KOLANO 1

2

3

5

6

7

8

10

18

25

No, they did not.

At any time did Marvin Mathis or his mother exercise any of his rights, specifically to remain silent, or asked for

25

4 an attorney?

Α. No.

> Did the, other than the reference in the rights themselves, did the word "attorney" come up, directly or indirectly in any way shape or form?

No. 9 Α.

Did Mr. Mathis talk freely?

Yes, he did. 11 Α.

Subsequently, after this form is signed off on, do you 12 conduct an oral interview of Marvin Mathis? 13

A. Yes, I did. 14

And was his mother present at the beginning of the 15

16 oral interview?

Yes, she is. 17

> Where does the oral interview take place? Q.

Inside the conference room. 19

At any time that evening up until very late was Marvin 20 Mathis placed under arrest formally? 21

A. Can you repeat. 22

Well, this is at 12:09. At this point is Marvin 23 Q.

placed under arrest formally? 24

> Α. No.





| [  |   |  |
|----|---|--|
|    | KOCZUR - DIRECT BY KOLANO 26                                    |  |
| 1  | Q. Is he handcuffed at any time?                                |  |
| 2  | A. No.  |  |
| 3  | Q. Any force, threats, or coercion used to get him to           |  |
| 4  | talk?   |  |
| 5  | A. No.  |  |
| 6  | Q. Any force, threats, or coercion used on his mother?          |  |
| 7  | A. No.  |  |
| 8  | Q. And his mother was present when you began the oral           |  |
| 9  | interview?  |  |
| 10 | A. Yes.   |  |
| 11 | Q. Who else was present when you began the oral                 |  |
| 12 | interview?  |  |
| 13 | A. Detective John Furda.  |  |
| 14 | Q. And did there come a point in time where                     |  |
| 15 | In your report did you detail what Mr. Mathis said as part      |  |
| 16 | of this oral interview?   |  |
| 17 | A. Not Little pieces, but not the very detailed report.         |  |
| 18 | No.   |  |
| 19 | Q. You subsequently took a first statement from Marvin          |  |
| 20 | Mathis?   |  |
| 21 | A. Yes.   |  |
| 22 | Q. Does that first statement pretty much cover the              |  |
| 23 | substance of what Marvin Mathis told you in the oral interview? |  |
| 24 | A. Yes.   |  |
| 25 | Q. Early in the early Early on in the oral interview            |  |
|    |   |  |

KOCZUR - DIRECT BY KOLANO 27 did he originally deny any involvement --1 2 Α. Yes. -- in this offense? 3 Q. Did there come a point in time where Mr. Mathis made a 4 request of you as related to his mother Linda Mathis? 5 Yes. 6 Α. And what was that request? 7 Q. He wanted his mother to leave the room. 8 9 I guess, at this point do you see Marvin Mathis in the 10 courtroom? Yes. 11 Α. Please identify him. 12 Q. Marvin Mathis seated to my left. He has braids, white 13 shirt, a maroon tank top on, beige pants, and dark shoes. 14 THE COURT: For the record, indicating the defendant. 15 What request did Mr. Mathis make of you? 16 Q. 17 He wanted his mother to leave the room. And his mother was present when he made this request? 18 Q. Yes. 19 Α. And did his mother have any objection to leaving the 20 Q. room? 21 22 A. No. Did his mother in fact leave the room? 23 Q. Yes, she did. 24 When his mother left the room what did Marvin Mathis 25 Q.

28 KOCZUR - DIRECT BY KOLANO say? 1 A. At that time he admitted that he was there present at the 2 shooting scene. 3 Q. Was his mother brought back into the room? 5 Yes. Did Mr. Marvin Mathis repeat what he had told the Q. 6 police in front of his mother? 7 A. Yes. 8 And did the oral interview continue at that point Q. after he admitted his involvement? 10 A. For a brief point, yes. 11 And then was there a subsequent written statement? 12 A. Yes. 13 Now, I am going to show you what has been marked S-41 14 for identification. I ask you to look at it, indicate whether 15 16 or not you recognize that. 17 A. Yes, I do. And what is that? Q. 18 This is the typewritten sworn statement provided by Marvin 19 20 Mathis 1/24/98 and --198? 21 Q. I am sorry. '96. 22 Α. And who is the typist for this statement? 23 This is Arlene McDonough. 24 Α. She is secretary at the Elizabeth Police Department?

25

Q.

29 KOCZUR - DIRECT BY KOLANO Yes, she is. 1 Α. Statement taken by you? 2 Q. A. Yes, it is. 3 4 Q. Now, prior to this statement being taken did you in fact take a statement from Linda Mathis? 5 A. Yes, I did. 6 And that was to basically cover the events leading up 7 Q. to Marvin's being brought to the school and Miss Mathis being 8 transported to the school? 9 That is correct. 10 And was Miss Linda Mathis, the defendant's mother, 11 present during this entire typewritten statement? Yes. 13 Α. Okay. Now, I have highlighted portions of this 14 statement. Would you also please read highlighted portions of 15 16 that statement. "Question: Earlier this day you were transported from your 17 school and brought to Elizabeth Police Department. 18 "Answer: Yes. 19 "Question: Did you come here upon your own free 20 will? 21 "Answer: Yes. 22 "Question: When you came to the police department 23 did I introduce myself to you and tell you the investigation 24 that I was conducting? 25

# 30 KOCZUR - DIRECT BY KOLANO "Answer: Yes. 1 "Question: That was the shooting and robbery of a 2 store owner on East Jersey Street in Elizabeth, is that 3 4 correct? "Answer: Yes. 5 "Did I then ask you not to speak to this detective 6 7 until I had your mother present? "Answer: Yes. 8 "Question: And you were not asked any questions in 9 regard to this case -- " I am sorry. Correction. 10 11 "And you were not asked any questions in regard to this, is that correct? 12 13 "Answer: Yes. "Question: A short time later you were brought from 14 an interview room and placed in a conference room of the 15 detective bureau, is that correct? 16 "Answer: Yes. 17 "Question: Who was in the room at that time? 18 "Answer: My mother, you, and two other detectives. 19 "Question: Did I again in the presence of your 20 mother inform you of the investigation that I was going to 21 conduct? 22 "Answer: Yes. 23 "Question: And I advised you of your constitutional 24 25 rights, is that correct?

25

statement there appear initials MM. Who put those initials

|    |      | KOCZUR - DIRECT BY KOLANO 33                              |
|----|------|---|
| 1  | ther | e?  |
| 2  | A.   | That is Marvin Mathis.                                    |
| 3  | :    | Q. They are on each of these nine pages?                  |
| 4  | A.   | Yes.  |
| 5  |      | Q. And on the last page an oath is administered by Lydia  |
| 6  | Mart | inez?   |
| 7  | Α.   | Yes.  |
| 8  |      | Q. And she is a secretary and notary at the Elizabeth     |
| 9  | Poli | ce Department?  |
| 10 | Α.   | Yes.  |
| 11 |      | Q. And signature here, who put that there?                |
| 12 | Α.   | Marvin Mathis.  |
| 13 |      | Q. Did you witness that?                                  |
| 14 | Α.   | Yes, I did.   |
| 15 |      | Q. There is a signature, whose is that?                   |
| 16 | Α.   | That's my signature.                                      |
| 17 |      | Q. Is the signature just below your signature, who is     |
| 18 | that | :?  |
| 19 | Α.   | Linda Mathis.   |
| 20 |      | Q. Was she present during the taking of this entire       |
| 21 | stat | ement?  |
| 22 | A.   | Yes, she was.   |
| 23 |      | Q. Now, part of the highlighted portion that you read you |
| 24 | aske | ed him keeping his constitutional rights in mind would he |
| 25 | have | any objection to basically a search of his house being    |
|    |      |   |

KOCZUR - DIRECT BY KOLANO 34 1 made? That is correct. 2 Α. And is that because in part of the substance that was Q. 3 4 not read here he talked about a pager and having a certain pair of pants on during the homicide? 5 A. That is correct. 6 And just for the record, this statement S-41 starts at 7 2:30 p.m.? 8 Yes, it does. 9 Now, I am going to show you what's marked S-39 for 10 identification for Miranda purposes only. Do you recognize 11 that? 12 A. Yes, I do. 13 What is that? Q. 14 This is the Elizabeth Police Department consent to search 15 16 form, and this is the one that I used with Marvin Mathis on this day 1/24/96. 17 What time was that executed? Q. 18 It was signed at 4:15 p.m. 19 20 Q. Who signed it? Marvin Mathis. 21 A. Who signed below? 22 Q. That's Linda Mathis. 23 Α. Q. That was the mother? 24 Yes. 25 Α.

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Q.

books containing black males.

Who was he looking for?

1 A. For Antwan.

- Q. And at that point the first time you heard the name Antwan was from Marvin Mathis?
- 4 A. Yes.

2

3

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

19

20

21

22

23

24

- Q. And you didn't know which Antwan it was at that point or did you?
  - A. Sir, I have, I have to correct. First time I heard name

    Antwan was Sharlama Brooks. The second time I heard the name

    Antwan came from Marvin Mathis.
    - Q. You left him in the room to look through basically all the books of black males to see if he could identify Antwan?

      A. Yes, sir.
      - Q. Now, did there come a point in time where you conducted a second oral interview of Marvin Mathis?
    - A. That is correct.
  - Q. And prior to you beginning the second oral interview, was he revised of his Miranda?
- 18 A. Yes, he was.
  - Q. And now showing you what has been marked S-37 for identification, for Miranda purposes only. I ask you to look at it and indicate whether or not you recognize that?
  - A. Yes, I do. This is the Elizabeth Police Department advisement of constitutional rights forms. This is the form that was used by me on 1/24/96 with Marvin Mathis.
    - Q. And what time was the start?

KOCZUR - DIRECT BY KOLANO 37 Starts at 5:45. 1 What time does it end? 2 Q. 5:46. A. 3 And there are initials after each of the five rights. 4 Q. 5 Who put those initials there? A. Marvin Mathis. 6 And did you go through the procedure the same way with 7 Q. this rights? 8 9 A. Yes, I did. And there is a signature here following the waiver. 10 Whose signature is that? 11 A. Marvin Mathis. 12 Whose signature is below as the witness? 13 Q. Linda Mathis. 14 And whose signature is the advising officer? 15 My signature. 16 The defendant's mother was present for the entire 17 Q. advisement of these rights at 5:45 to 5:46? 18 A. Yes. 19 Did the defendant up until this point in time in any 20 way shape or form exercise either his right to silence or his 21 right to have an attorney? 22 No. Α. 23 Was any force, threats, or coercion used on him at 24 this point? 25

|    |     | KOCZUR - DIRECT BY KOLANO 38                                |   |
|----|-----|---|---|
| 1  | A.  | No.   |   |
| 2  |     | Q. He continued to be in the conference room                |   |
| 3  | unh | and cuffed?   |   |
| 4  | A.  | Yes.  |   |
| 5  |     | Q. And throughout this entire evening everyone was in       |   |
| 6  | pla | in clothes as far as police personnel involvement?          |   |
| 7  | A.  | Yes.  |   |
| 8  |     | Q. Except for secretaries, whatever they were wearing.      |   |
| 9  | A.  | Yes.  |   |
| 10 |     | Q. Now, did you conduct an oral interview following the     |   |
| 11 | sec | ond advisement of Miranda at 5:46?                          |   |
| 12 | A.  | Yes.  |   |
| 13 |     | Q. And was Miss Mathis, Linda Mathis present for that       |   |
| 14 | ora | l interview?  |   |
| 15 | A.  | Yes.  |   |
| 16 |     | Q. And did you take a subsequent written statement from     |   |
| 17 | Mar | vin Mathis?   |   |
| 18 | A.  | Yes, I did.   |   |
| 19 |     | Q. Was Miss Linda Mathis present for that entire written    | n |
| 20 | sta | tement?   |   |
| 21 | A.  | Yes.  |   |
| 22 |     | Q. Showing you what is marked S-40 for identification,      | I |
| 23 | ask | you to look at it and indicate whether or not you recognize | z |
| 24 | tha | t?  | , |
| 25 | Α.  | Yes. This is the typewritten sworn statement given by       |   |
|    |     |   |   |

39 KOCZUR - DIRECT BY KOLANO Marvin Mathis on 1/24/96. 1 And what time does that statement begin? 0. 2 6:50 p.m. 3 Q. And is this also in the conference room? It's at the typewriter outside the conference room. 5 That's the secretaries' general area? Q. 6 7 Yes. Α. Would it be fair to describe that as an open area? Q. 8 Yes, it is. 9 Α. And at that point are there lot of police personnel 10 around at 6:50? 11 No. Very few. 12 Please, would you read highlighted portions of this 13 Q. S-40 statement. 14 A. "Question: Marvin, I then advised you of your Miranda 15 16 rights, is that correct? "Answer: Yes. 17 "Question: Did you understand your Miranda rights 18 19 at that time? "Answer: Yes. 20 "Question: And with your constitutional rights in 21 mind, did you make statements regarding this homicide? 22 "Answer: Yes. 23 "Question: At this time do you wish to continue by 24 giving a typewritten sworn statement? 25

41 KOCZUR - DIRECT BY KOLANO No. 1 Α. Did he exercise any of his constitutional rights to 2 Q. remain silent, for an attorney, or any constitutional rights 3 regarding this second statement? 4 5 No. Was Linda Mathis cooperative with you at this point? Q. 6 Yes. 7 Α. And did there come a point in time in the interview of Q. 8 Mr. Marvin Mathis that she also pointed out some 9 inconsistencies? 10 Yes. 11 A. Detective, from being there did Mr. Marvin Mathis as Q. 12 well as his mother in your opinion knowingly, voluntarily, and 13 intelligently waive all of his rights and cooperate and provide 14 the information that you have identified here today? 15 16 A. Yes. Thank you. I have nothing further. 17 MR. KOLANO: CROSS EXAMINATION BY MR. FLORCZAK: 18 Detective, at what time did you request the presence, 19 Q. that Mr. Mathis be produced? 20 A. A little after ten o'clock, sir. 21 Who did you speak to? 22 Q. Lieutenant Gary Lewis. 23 What did you tell him? 24 Q. At that time I informed him that Marvin Mathis, high school Α. 25

- student, was a possible suspect in this case.
- Q. Okay. Was any arrest warrant requested for Mr.

42

3 Mathis?

1

2

- 4 A. No.
- 5 Q. And how much later was he in police headquarters?
- 6 A. Say approximately an hour later.
- 7 Q. Did you see him come in?
- 8 A. No.
  - Q. When was the first time you saw him?
- 10 A. A little after eleven, sir.
- 11 | Q. Where was he at that time?
- 12 A. In the conference room of the detective bureau.
- 13 | Q. Did you speak to him at that time?
- 14 | A. Yes, I did.
- 15 | Q. And what did you ask him at that time?
- 16 A. At that time I didn't ask him anything. I told him that he
- 17 | was a suspect in this case.
- 18 | Q. And that's all you said to him?
- 19 A. I explained to him -- He started asking me questions. And
- 20 | I says Marvin, I can't talk to you at all about this case.
- 21 | This is a very serious case, a very serious charge, we have to
- 22 | get either your mother or a guardian present. And at that time
- 23 he provided me with the information of how his mother can be
- 24 reached.
- 25 Q. So you asked him where his mother worked or where she





43 KOCZUR - CROSS BY FLORCZAK was and so forth? 1 2 Α. Yes. Now, you took a statement from his mother, is that 3 4 correct? 5 A. Yes. And you put in your statement something -- let's see, 6 during the first, let's see, something about in the statement 7 about from time to time she left the room? 8 That is correct. Α. How many times did she leave the room? 10 I believe maybe two or three. 11 How many times at the request of her son? 12 Q. A. Just once. 13 And under what circumstances did she leave the other 14 Q. times? 15 A. As the truth of this case was coming out she appeared to be 16 upset, but I don't know what was inside Mrs. Mathis' mind. 17 After she was out of the room did you continue to Q. 18 question Mr. Mathis? 19 20 Yes. And you are aware at the time he was fifteen years 21 Q. old, is that correct? 22 A. Yes. 23 And you were also aware at the time that he should 24 Q. have a parent present at all times that he is questioned, isn't 25

KOCZUR - CROSS BY FLORCZAK 45 Yes. 1 Q. But does indicate, and if I may read the question and 2 3 answer. 4 Q. Go ahead. A. "During this interview from time to time you left the room 5 and your son was with detective Furda and Lieutenant Louis, is 6 that correct? 7 "Answer: Yes." 8 "Question: And you had no objection to that? 9 "Answer: No." 10 Now, you indicated that you advised Mr. Mathis of his 11 rights at 12:07, is that correct? 12 A. Yes, sir. 13 And that these rights were signed by him and his 14 mother at 12:09, is that correct? 15 16 A. Yes, sir. And that was after you would read each right to him, 17 is that correct? 18 19 A. Yes, sir. So that between 12:07 and 12:09 you read to him You 20 have the right to remine silent, do you understand this? 21 A. Yes, sir. 22 He would respond, he would initial? 23 Q. After his mother also indicated that she understood it, 24

then he initialled, sir.

46

- Q. Then you asked him Anything you say can and will be used against you in a court of law. Do you understand this?
- A. That is correct.
- Q. And you asked for a response from both him and his mother?
- 6 A. Yes.

1

2

- 7 Q. You received the response, and you asked him to sign
- 8 | it. Is that correct?
- 9 A. Initial. Yes.
- 10 Q. Initial. I am sorry.
- 11 Then you asked him third question: You have the right to
- 12 | talk to a lawyer and have him present while you are being
- 13 questioned. Do you understand this? That was asked, is that
- 14 | correct?
- 15 A. Yes, sir. It was.
- 16 Q. And you got a response to whether they understood it,
- 17 | both from him and his mother?
- 18 | A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Then you asked him If you cannot afford to lawyer, a
- 20 lawyer, one will be appointed to represent you before any
- 21 | questioning, if you wish. Do you understand this?
- 22 | And you followed the same procedure again?
- 23 | A. Yes, sir.
- Q. And you received the same answers?
- 25 A. Yes.



Q. And you also asked, You can decide at any time to exercise these rights and not answer any questions or make any statements. Do you understand this?

47

And, again, they each responded. Is that correct?

A. Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

- Q. And then you read -- Did you read it to them or have them read -- I have read these, this statement of my rights and I understand what my rights are. I am willing to make a statement and answer questions. No promises or threats have been made to me, and no pressure or coercion of any kind has been used against me. Did they read that, did you read that to them?
- A. I read that to them.
- Q. And at that time you asked, simply, whether they understood it, and they responded affirmatively?
- 16 | A. Yes.
- Q. And signed it. So that in that two minutes all this was done, and you decided that they understood, he understood what his rights were, is that correct?
- 20 | A. Yes, sir.
- Q. Did you ask him at any time to explain what any of these things meant?
- 23 A. Did I ask him?
- 24 Q. Yes.
  - A. No. After he indicated to me that he understood them I





KOCZUR - CROSS BY FLORCZAK 48 1 didn't feel it was necessary. And you didn't ask his mother to explain any of these 2 Q. 3 items that she said she understood, is that correct? Α. No. Did you ask them to read any of these items? 5 Q. 6 No. 7 When you decided to get Mr. Mathis from the high Q. 8 school did you have any idea of his background? No. 9 Α. Were you aware he had no record of any kind? 10 Q. 11 No. So you were not aware that he had previously not been 12 Q. arrested for anything? 13 14 A. No. And were you aware that he was a special education 15 Q. student in the school? 16 A. No. 17 So you weren't aware he may have had certain learning 18 Q. 19 disabilities that made it difficult for him to understand any of these things? 20 No. 21 So you just assumed in the two minutes that you read 22 Q. 23 this that he understood everything? A. Yes. 24 Now, the first statement -- I am sorry. 25

Do you recall what time you first saw him? Was it eleven,

49

2 11:15?

- 3 A. Approximately that time.
- Q. So that he was sitting there for how long before you
- 5 | first started questioning him?
- 6 A. I have no idea how long he was sitting there, sir.
- 7 Q. Do you have any idea what time you started questioning
- 8 him?
- 9 A. Myself?
- 10 Q. Yes.
- 11 | A. After 12:07, sir.
- 12 Q. Were you aware what anyone else questioned him prior
- 13 | to 12:07?
- 14 A. No one questioned him, sir.
- 15 Q. Were you with him that entire time?
- 16 | A. No, sir.
- 17 Q. So you are assuming that no one questioned him. You
- 18 | weren't present with him.
- 19 A. I was not present, no, sir.
- 20 Q. And that first statement took how long, can you tell
- 21 me?
- 22 A. The oral statement, sir, written statement? Which portion
- 23 | are you talking about?
- Q. The written statement. That started at, what, 2:30?
- 25 A. I am not sure how long it took. I would say approximately





1

3

KOCZUR - CROSS BY FLORCZAK

50

- half hour to forty-five minutes.
- I notice some statements have a start and finish time, 2 other statements don't. Is there any reason for that?
- I believe that's either a detective's preference or 5 typist's preference.
- So you questioned Mr. Mathis from 12:09 until what 6 time, do you recall? 7
- In the oral interview or written? 8
- Yes, oral interview. 9
- From about twelve to just about -- the typewritten 10 11 statement started. We did take a short break for lunch.
- How long was that break? 12 Q.
- That would be approximately hour and a half. 13
- An hour and a half for lunch? Q. 14
- 15 No. We only took about fifteen, twenty minutes lunch.
- 16 Q. Maybe hour and a half for oral questioning of my
- client. Is that correct? 17
- Yes. 18 Α.
- And during that time how many times did his mother 19 Q.
- leave the room? 20
- A. Approximately two or three. 21
- And for how long was she gone the first time, do you 22 Q.
- recall? 23

- 24 No. It was very brief.
  - You don't recall exactly how long either the two or Q.



51

- three times she left the room?
- A. No.

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

17

18

20

21

22

23

24

- Q. But each time questioning continued, is that correct?
- 4 A. Yes.
  - Q. So it was your understanding that a juvenile had a right to waive his mother's presence if he so chose?
  - A. No. Mother waived his rights along with him, sir. Both His mother had no objection to leaving the room, and Marvin
- 9 didn't have any objection to his mother leaving the room.
  - Q. Is there anything that -- was she ever informed she had a right to be present when he was being questioned?
  - A. Yes, sir.
  - Q. Does that appear in any of your reports, that she was told that she could, that she had a right to be present?
- 15 A. By me, just asking her, that's when I told her you don't

  16 have to leave the room. However, if you feel free to, you can
  - Q. First statement is a ten page statement. Is it ten pages? Nine page statement. Is that correct?
- 19 A. Yes, sir.
  - Q. And after this statement was completed can you tell me what did you do with the statement before he signed it. What did you do?
  - A. At that time I took the entire statement, gave it to both him and his mother, asked him if he understood each page to place his initials at the end of that page. If he sees any





MR. KOLANO: You can use S-41, since it's marked.

I ask you to look at S-41 and identify it for us,

52

23

24

25

Q.

(Pause).

please.

half hour.

1

2

3

5

6

7

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

20

22

23

24

25

Q. 2:30 statement I am asking about.

THE COURT: I believe S-41 was the first statement,

54

4 | S-40 is the second statement.

MR. KOLANO: I apologize.

- Q. Statement started, now, is this the -- this is after preliminary oral statement is taken. Is that correct?
- 8 A. Yes, sir.
- 9 Q. So that most of the information you expected to get 10 you have already essentially heard, is that correct?
- 11 A. This statement? Yes, sir.
  - Q. So that approximately 3:15 or so this statement was completed?
    - A. May have been longer. I am not exactly sure. I have to refer back to some, the statement, when he signed the Miranda and the written statement.
    - Q. Now, at what point did Linda Mathis leave for substantial part of the time?
- 19 A. She never left for a substantial part, sir.
  - Q. Didn't she go to recover items from her house?
- 21 A. We are talking after the statement now, sir?
  - Q. At any time from the point my client was in police headquarters to the point of time he was locked up?
  - A. During the oral and written statement she was never gone for a substantial period of time. After the statement was



1

2

3

6

7

8

### KOCZUR - CROSS BY FLORCZAK

taken, and consent to search was signed, she accompanied a detective back to her son's house.

55

- Q. Was that between the two statements or after the second statement?
- 5 A. That was between the two statements.
  - Q. So approximately 3:30, or whatever time this first statement was completed, was the time that she left. Is that correct?
- 9 A. It was after that. Yes, sir.
- 10 Q. And where was Marvin Mathis during this time?
- 11 A. He was seated inside the conference room the last time I
  12 saw him.
- Q. Did you remain there or did you go with the mother to her home?
- 15 A. No, sir. I was, I went to Union County Prosecutor's office 16 at that time.
  - Q. Did you at any time tell Marvin and or his mother that as soon as he gave the statement he could go home?
- 19 A. No.

17

18

- Q. There came a point in time that you decided to take a second statement. Is that correct?
- 22 A. Yes.
- Q. This was not at behest of Mr. Mathis, then. He didn't request to give a second statement, did he?
  - A. No. Sorry. Yes, sir, he did. It was after he was





56

Mirandized he did give a statement voluntarily.

- Q. I understand. Well, no. I am not trying to confuse you, officer. I mean after he had been Mirandized before the first statement?
- A. Yes.

1

2

3

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

19

24

25

- Q. You had a complete statement, you had his mother go to her house and get whatever clothing you needed. Shy came back?

  A. Yes.
  - Q. Why was the second statement taken?
- A. After reviewing all the evidence that came forth during this case, I didn't believe Marvin Mathis was totally telling me the truth. I mentioned that to his mother and I asked his mother again I would like to talk to Marvin a little bit longer. And she agreed. She did not believe Marvin was totally telling the truth either. And at that time I re-Mirandized him and we began a second interview.
  - Q. And what time did the second statement start?
- 18 A. If I can refer to the statement, to be accurate, please.
  - Q. Sure. Do you have it here? Okay.
- I show you what has been marked S-40 for identification.
- 21 A. That written statement started at 6:50 p.m.
- 22 Q. And can you tell us how long that statement took?
- 23 | A. I would estimate about an hour.
  - Q. After this statement was taken, what happened, where did Marvin Mathis go?





1 A. At that time I called Union County Prosecutor's office, and

57

- 2 | we were going to meet for complaint approval. And Marvin
- 3 | Mathis at that time, that point wasn't free to leave, so I
- 4 | placed him in holding pen in cell block at Elizabeth
- 5 headquarters.
- 6 Q. For how long was he there, if you know?
- 7 A. Several hours.
- Q. Do you know what time he was finally taken to the
- 9 | Union County youth detention center?
- 10 A. No, I do not.
- 11 Q. If I told you it was -- Let's see. Did you take him
- 12 | finally or did someone else take him?
- 13 MR. KOLANO: I object. These are all events that
- 14 happened after Miranda. This is a limited hearing for limited
- 15 purpose. What happened afterwards, state is not alleging any
- 16 | statements made at that point, so it's beyond the scope of this
- 17 | hearing.
- 18 MR. FLORCZAK: May not be what the defense is
- 19 alleging, judge. It is the period he was in police custody.
- 20 THE COURT: I will allow the question. Just close out
- 21 | this area.
- 22 Q. Did you take him to Union County juvenile detention
- 23 | center?
- 24 A. No.

25

Q. If their report indicates that he was processed in at



58

Yes. 20

21

23

it? 22

A. Yes.

Q.

Could you see whether they were reading it or not or 24 Q. what they were doing? 25

And you asked him again if they read and understand

## KOCZUR - CROSS BY FLORCZAK 59 They were taking their time looking over each page, but I 1 couldn't see what they were reading. You didn't ask him to demonstrate his ability to read Q. 3 4 any of the questions or answers, is that correct? No, sir. 5 MR. FLORCZAK: That's all. 6 REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. KOLANO: 7 During the time between the consent form at 4:15 and 8 Q. the second Miranda at 5:45 you indicated on cross examination 9 that you went to the prosecutor's office. 10 A. Yes, sir. 11 And Detective Furda where did he go to your knowledge? 12 Q. A. He was with Mrs. Mathis, and they went to Magnolia Avenue. 13 During this large gap of time when Mrs. Mathis was not 14 Q. there was anybody talking to Marvin Mathis? 15 16 A. No. And you weren't in the building? 17 Q. A. No. 18 And the other primary detective, Detective Furda, was 19 actually with Mrs. Mathis? 20 A. Yes. 21 The statements that you identified were they taken 22 Q. down verbatim as to the defendant's words? 23 A. Yes. 24

In reference to the second statement, one that starts

25

Q.

Case 2:15-cv-02092-JLL Document 10-28 Filed 08/07/15 Page 60 of 117 PageID: 1471 60 - KOCZUR at 6:50 p.m., does the defendant give you some information 1 while you are in the process of that written statement that he 2 did not give you in the oral statement? 3 A. That is correct. 5 What? For the first time he indicates Renee and April Diggs are 6 co-defendants in this case. 7 And the first time you became aware of the existence 8 Q. of April and Renee Diggs as related to this case was when? 9 During the second written statement. 10 And that came from Marvin Mathis? 11 Yes. 12 Α. And I think reference was made --13 Q. Do you have Linda Mathis' statement that was marked as D-1 14 in front of you? 15 16 A. Yes, I do. Would you please on the first page read the question 17 Q.

- Q. Would you please on the first page read the question that starts At approximately 12:07 p.m. and read remainder of that page, please.
- 20 A. "Question: At approximately 12:07 p.m. your son was 21 advised of his constitutional rights, is that correct?

"Answer: Yes.

"And you and your son understood his rights and you wanted your son to cooperate with these detectives, is that correct?



22

23

24

- KOCZUR - 61

"Answer: Yes."

Q. So you took a statement where even Linda Mathis acknowledges in her own sworn written statement that her son was advised of his rights, he waived his rights, and it was her position that he would cooperate with the investigation?

A. Yes.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

- Q. Did Mr. Mathis at any time indicate to you that he couldn't read the English language?
- 9 A. No.
- Q. Was all of this done orally, except for the typewriter or statement that was being taken by the typist?
- 12 | A. Yes.
- Q. Are these his words that were spoken, whether or not he could read?
- 15 A. Yes.
- Q. Was this edited or changed or basically did you lie,
  did you put stuff in the statement to implicate him?
- 18 A. No.
- Q. Could you have put in the information about, for instance, Renee and April Diggs, if you wanted to?
- 21 | A. I didn't know. It was impossible to.
- 22 MR. KOLANO: Nothing further.
- 23 MR. FLORCZAK: One or two questions.
- 24 RECROSS EXAMINATION BY MR. FLORCZAK:
  - Q. Were there any changes or corrections in the second







62 - KOCZUR statement made by Marvin Mathis or his mother? 1 If I may just look through it to be accurate. 2 3 0. Sure. No, sir. 4 Α. Who was the third detective in the room most of the 5 You said there were three detectives I believe. time? 6 A. Detective Lieutenant Gary Lewis was in and out of the room 7 sir. 8 9 Q. And he remained at police headquarters when you went to prosecutor's office, and the other detective accompanied 10 Linda Mathis to her apartment. Is that correct? 11 Yes. He was also there with Detective Keith White. 12 MR. FLORCZAK: Thank you. I have nothing. 13 MR. KOLANO: I do have one follow up. 14 REDIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. KOLANO: 15 You indicated at one point in time Mrs. Mathis left 16 17 the room and that's when the defendant Marvin Mathis made his first, quote, admission to involvement? 18 Yes. 19 Α. Based on your experience, was this an unusual 20 situation in dealing with juveniles when they ask their parents 21 to leave before they admit to being involved in homicide? 22 No. 23 Α. Nothing further. MR. KOLANO: 24

You may step down.

THE COURT:

- KOCZUR -63 THE WITNESS: Thank you, your Honor. 1 THE COURT: Watch your step as you step off. 2 MR. KOLANO: If I may just approach to collect the 3 4 written documentation. 5 THE COURT: Yes. MR. KOLANO: Your Honor, as it relates to Miranda 6 hearing I will have no more witnesses. I would ask for the 7 limited purpose of the Miranda hearing to admit into evidence 8 9 S-40, S-36, S-39, S-38, S-37, and S-41. THE COURT: For purposes of the Miranda those items 10 will be received in evidence. 11 MR. KOLANO: I have no further witnesses, your Honor. 12 THE COURT: Mr. Florczak, any witnesses on Miranda? 13 MR. FLORCZAK: Judge, I may have Miss Mathis. I would 14 like to speak to her for a moment, if I could. 15 16 THE COURT: All right. We will take a short break at 17 this time. Take a break for ten minutes. MR. FLORCZAK: Thank you, judge. 18 (Short recess). 19 20 21 22 23 24 25





64 - KOCZUR -THE COURT: Mr. Florczak, your witness, please. 1 MR. FLORCZAK: Yes. I call Linda Mathis to the stand 2 your Honor. 3 4 LINDA MATHIS Sworn as a witness and testified as follows: 5 DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. FLORCZAK: 6 THE COURT: Mr. Florczak. 7 Miss Mathis, are you related to Marvin? Q. 8 A. Yes. He is my son. 9 I direct your attention back to January 24th, 1996, 10 the day Marvin was taken to police headquarters. Do you 11 remember that? 12 Yes. 13 Α. When did you first learn that he was at police 14 15 headquarters? The detective they called to my job. 16 What did they tell you? 17 Q. They told me that they had my son at the police station, 18 and they wanted to come pick me up to question him. 19 And did they come and pick you up? 20 Yes, they come to pick me up. 21 And they took to you police headquarters? 22 Q. Yes. 23 Α. Q. And you saw Marvin there? 24

25

Α.

Yes.

# LINDA MATHIS - DIRECT BY FLORCZAK

- Q. When you first got there, can you tell us what happened?
  - A. When we first got there, they, they was questioning him.

65

- 4 Q. When you -- Where was he when you first got there?
- 5 A. He was in the room.

3

- Q. And who else was in the room?
- 7 A. It was me and detective.
- 8 Q. Do you recall how many detectives were in the room?
- 9 | A. I think it was four. I am not quite sure.
- 10 Q. Was there a typist or anyone typing?
- 11 | A. Not right then, no.
- Q. Right then, when you first got there. When did they
- 13 | start asking questions, first when you first got there, do you
- 14 | recall what they said to you?
- 15 A. I don't remember, but they was asking him, my son
- 16 questions.
- 17 Q. Okay. Do you recall what kind of questions they were
- 18 | asking?
- 19 | A. They was asking him where he was at that night, and, you
- 20 know, was he with, you know, Antwan and the girl, two girls.
- Q. Okay. I show you what has been marked S-38 in
- 22 | evidence. Do you recognize that?
- 23 A. What, number one?
- Q. That paper there. Do you recognize signing it? Do
- 25 | you remember signing that?





## LINDA MATHIS - DIRECT BY FLORCZAK 66 1 It been two years. Does it have your signature on it? 2 Q. Yes. 3 Α. Okay. Do you know what this paper is? You can look Q. at it. Do you know what that paper is? 5 Your rights. 6 Did you read any of this at that time? 7 Q. I was reading a lot of papers. 8 9 Did they read that to you, perhaps? Yes, I think, yes they read that thing. I am not quite 10 It been over two years. 11 sure. I understand. Do you remember whether they asked, 12 Q. whether they told Marvin he had a right to remain silent? 13 14 Yes, I remember that part. Yes. And they asked him if he understood that? 15 Yes. They asked if he understood. Yes. 16 17 Q. Did they ask if you understood? Yes. I told them yes, I understood. But I have, I have 18 never been in no trouble before and he been in no trouble 19 before either. This is first time. 20 Do you know at what point you signed this. You signed 21 22 this after they started questioning or before they started



23

24

25

A. I think after. I am not quite sure.

questioning him?

Q. Well, while you were there, and they were asking him

Did you make any corrections in the statement?

25

Q.

| 1   |   |
|-----|---|
|     | LINDA MATHIS - DIRECT BY FLORCZAK 68                        |
| 1   | A. No.  |
| 2   | Q. Now, when you were there you heard what Marvin was       |
| . 3 | saying, is that correct?                                    |
| 4   | A. Yes.   |
| 5   | Q. And let me find the statement.                           |
| 6   | Did he ever while you were there admit being involved in    |
| 7   | the homicide?   |
| 8   | A. No. No.  |
| 9   | Q. What did he admit, do you recall?                        |
| 10  | A. He Detective asked him did he shoot the man, and he told |
| 11  | him no, he didn't get close to the man.                     |
| 12  | Q. Did he say anything about being involved in a robbery?   |
| 13  | A. No.  |
| 14  | Q. Well, you were asked to sign a statement. Right?         |
| 15  | A. Yes.   |
| 16  | Q. And did you read that statement, do you recall?          |
| 17  | Let me show you.  |
| 18  | MR. KOLANO: D-1.  |
| 19  | Q. I show you what has been marked D-1 for                  |
| 20  | identification. Look at both pages and tell me if you       |
| 21  | recognize that?   |
| 22  | A. Yes.   |
| 23  | Q. Is that your statement? Did you sign that statement?     |
| 24  | A. Yes.   |
| 25  | Q. On the second page, second question says Your son        |
|     | <u>'</u>  |

LINDA MATHIS - DIRECT BY FLORCZAK 69 eventually admitted that he was present and involved in this 1 2 homicide, is that correct? And the answer says Yes. Is that what you told them? 3 I didn't say, I didn't say he was involved, that. 4 But did you read the statement before you signed it? 5 Yes. 6 Α. 7 Do you recall saying that? Q. No. 8 Α. I am sorry. I didn't hear your answer. 9 Q. No. 10 While you were there and while they were questioning 11 Q. Marvin, did there come a time or more than one time that you 12 left the room? 13 14 A. Yes, I left the room. Okay. Who asked you to leave the room? 15 Α. The detective. 16 Which detective? Do you recall which one? 17 Q. I don't know which one. 18 Did he tell you why, or did you know why? 19 He told me leave the room because they wanted to talk to 20 Marvin. 21 Did they ever tell you you had a right to stay in the 22 Q. 23 room? 24 Α. No. Do you recall how many times you left the room? 25 Q.

2

3

5

6

7

15

16

17

18

### LINDA MATHIS - DIRECT BY FLORCZAK

70

- 1 | A. I don't remember. I don't remember.
  - Q. Okay. That time that you left, they asked you to leave and you left, how long did you leave for, do you know?
  - A. I didn't stay long. Maybe about ten minutes.
  - Q. At any point while you were there with Marvin did any of the detectives tell you that he would have to stay or that he could go home or anything else?
- 8 A. One of the detectives told him that they might let him go.
- 9 Q. Did they say under what circumstances or what he had 10 to do, or anything else?
- 11 A. No. No.
- Q. Your statement indicates how far in school you got.

  Do you recall how far you went in school?
- 14 A. I don't remember they asking me that. I don't remember.
  - Q. On the second page of your statement, maybe it will refresh your recollection, next to the last question: What is the extent of your education? And it says 11th. Does that mean, does that refresh your recollection?
- 19 A. Yes, I finished, stopped at 11th. Yes.
- 20 MR. FLORCZAK: I have nothing further. Thank you.
- MR. KOLANO: No questions, your Honor.
  - THE COURT: All right. Miss Mathis, thank you. You may step down. Watch your step.

(THERE IS NO PAGE 71.)
(Numbering error.)

24

22

23

1...

MR. FLORCZAK: Judge, at this time I would call Marvin

72

- 2 Mathis to the stand.
- 3 MARVIN MATHIS
- 4 | Sworn as a witness and testified as follows:
- 5 DIRECT EXAMINATION BY MR. FLORCZAK:
- 6 Q. Mr. Mathis, how old are you?
- 7 A. Eighteen.
- 8 Q. How old were you on January 24th, 1998?
- 9 A. '98?

- 10 Q. '96. I am sorry.
- 11 A. Fifteen.
- 12 Q. Marvin, do you recall being arrested back in January
- 13 | 24th of '96?
- 14 A. Yes, sir.
- 15 Q. Okay. Where were you arrested?
- 16 A. At Jefferson High School. Jefferson High.
- 17 Q. Thomas Jefferson High School?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. Do you recall what time of day it was?
- 20 A. It was in the morning.
- 21 | Q. Do you recall which class you were in, what period --
- 22 | first, second, third, fourth?
- 23 | A. I believe I was in history class.
- 24 Q. Which? First?
- 25 | A. First period, like my first period.





st period

73

- Q. Okay. How did -- What happened in that first period class?
- A. First period class, one detective and vice-principal came to my classroom. And vice-principal asked one of my teacher's substitute -- my regular teacher wasn't there. The vice-principal asked substitute teacher was I in class, and substitute teacher said yes. That's when they say can they speak to him for a minute. That's when I left the classroom
  - Q. Now, do you recall which detective this was?
- 11 | A. This was Detective Garcia.

and went to vice-principal's office.

- 12 Q. From there you went to the vice-principal's office?
- 13 A. Correct.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

- 14 Q. What happened there?
- A. Well, vice-principal started asking me some questions about
  why I didn't play no sports that year. Then detective cut
  vice-principal off, he told him -- he introduce himself -- and
  he said he was investigating the homicide that happened that
  night. He told me they need me to come to the police station
  to question me.
- Q. Okay. Now, did you go to the police station voluntarily?
- 23 A. No. They told me I have to.
- 24 Q. Who told you?
  - A. Detective Garcia.

| _   |  |
|-----|--|
|     | MI. MATHIS - DIRECT BY MR. FLORCZAK 74                         |
| 1   | Q. You saw this first detective who testified?                 |
| 2   | A. Correct, yes.   |
| 3   | Q. Was he there?   |
| 4   | A. When we was in vice-principal's office, no.                 |
| 5   | Q. Where did you meet him?                                     |
| 6   | A. First floor when we was leaving out the door.               |
| 7   | Q. You were leaving out the door with whom?                    |
| 8   | A. With Detective Garcia.                                      |
| 9   | Q. Okay. And you went in the police car?                       |
| 10  | A. Regular car.  |
| 11  | Q. Who was in the car with you?                                |
| 12  | A. Detective Garcia and Detective Brown.                       |
| 13  | Q. Did they at any time tell you you didn't have to go         |
| 14  | with them?   |
| 15  | A. At that time, no.   |
| 16  | Q. At any time?  |
| 17  | A. In the car?   |
| 18  | Q. Anywhere.   |
| 19  | A. No.   |
| 20  | Q. When you got to police headquarters, what happened?         |
| 21  | A. When I got to police headquarters, that's when two          |
| 22  | detectives dropped me off, they put me in the questioning room |
| 23. | or whatever.   |
| 24  | Q. Okay. Where did you go in the police headquarters?          |
| 25  | A. Police headquarters, I went to the I don't know the room    |
|     |  |

1 but 1

2

3

M. MATHIS - DIRECT BY MR. FLORCZAK

but I went, they put me in this room.

Q. Was there anybody else in the room when they put you there?

- 4 A. Not that minute, no. I was by myself.
- 5 Q. Okay. What happened then?
- A. Then five minutes later one of the detectives came in told
  me, he asked me what was my name. I told him my name. He
- 8 introduce his self, then he told me --
- Q. Who was he, do you recall?
- 10 A. I don't remember his name.
- 11 Q. Go ahead?
- 12 A. He told me they investigating homicide that happened that
  13 night, they don't ask nothing further until my parent, whoever
- 14 | come in.
- 15 Q. What happened then?
- 16 A. Then he left out.
- 17 Q. All right.
- 18 A. Then another detective came in, introduce his self. Then
- 19 he asked me what's my name. I told him my name. That's when
- 20 detective started like, like pull some questions out of me.
- 21 | told him, he don't ask me all the questions until my mother
- 22 | come. That's when he shook his head and left out.
- Q. Do you recall what his name was?
- 24 A. I forgot his name.
- 25 | Q. In any case, you didn't answer any questions for him?





76 MI. MATHIS - DIRECT BY MR. FLORCZAK 1 No. Did there come a point where they got your mother's 2 Q. 3 name from you and where she worked and so forth? Yes. Α. Did there come a point in time that your mother got 5 Q. there? 6 7 Yes. Α. How long were you there before your mother got there, 8 do you recall? 9 I can't recall. It was a while ago. 10 What happened when your mother got there? 11 When my mother arrived they put me -- My mother she was in 12 the conference room already. That's when they brought me in 13 the conference room. And they start asking my mother question\$ 14 then, like, started asking questions. 15 Who was in the conference room besides your mother and 16 you? 17 Three detectives. 18 Okay. Now, they asked your mother questions first? 19 Q. 20 Α. Yes. Do you recall what they were asking her about? 21 I can't recall. 22 Α. Then what happened after they asked her some 23 Q. 24 questions? Then he start asking me questions: Do I know what 25

## M. MATHIS - DIRECT BY MR. FLORCZAK

77

- 1 happened?
- Q. And do you recall signing a form telling you what your
- 3 | rights are?
- 4 A. Yes.
- Q. Can you tell us at what point you signed that?
- 6 A. This was like after I made the first statement.
- Q. I show you what has been marked S-38 for
- 8 | identification. Do you recognize that?
- 9 A. Yes, I do.
- 10 Q. What is that?
- 11 A. This the sheet that detective gave me, told me I have to
- 12 | put my initials and stuff on.
- 13 Q. All right. Did you -- Did he read that sheet to you,
- 14 do you recall?
- 15 A. Yes, he did. He read it to me.
- 16 | Q. And did he ask you questions after -- Did he read each
- 17 one and ask you that you understand?
- 18 A. Yes, he did.
- 19 Q. And did you understand it?
- 20 A. Not that good, no.
- 21 | Q. Did you tell him that?
- 22 A. No.
- Q. And you signed it?
- 24 A. Yes.

25

Q. Did you put the time there or did the detective put



MI. MATHIS - DIRECT BY MR. FLORCZAK 78 the time there? 1 The detective put the time. Do you recall whether that was the time, correct time 3 Q. 4 or not? I can't recall. 5 I show you what has been marked S-41 for 6 identification. Look at that. Can you tell me what that is? 7 This is a statement, I guess. 8 Do you know which statement it is, first statement, 9 second statement, or --? 10 I am not sure. I think it's the first statement. 11 All right. Now, do you recall them asking you 12 questions and typing up this statement? 13 Yes. 14 Α. After they finished the statement, what happened after 15 16 they finished typing it? A. After they finished typing it, detective stepped out the 17 room with the statement; then ten, fifteen minutes he came back 18 to me, he was like This statement is not correct. 19 Well, prior to him stepping out of the room with the 20 statement, did you sign the statement? 21 A. At that time, no. 22 At some point did he ask you to sign the statement? 23 I can't recall. 24 A.

Did you sign the statement?

25

Q.

MI. MATHIS - DIRECT BY MR. FLORCZAK 79 Yes, I did sign the statement. 1 Did you initial each page? 2 Q. Look at the pages and tell me if they have your initials. 3 4 Yes. Α. And last page have your signature? 5 Α. Yes. 6 So they asked you to sign and initial it? 7 Q. Yes. 8 Α. 9 Q. They asked to you read it first? Yes. 10 Did you read it? 11 Q. Well, I was reading, but he was rushing me, so he told me 12 just go over it real quick and give it back to him. 13 Did you read entire document? 14 Not entire one, no. 15 16 Let me see. Was your mother with you when you read 17 this, when you looked at it? Yes. 18 Α. Do you know whether she looked at it? 19 Q. I am not for sure, but I think she did. 20 After you signed this statement what happened? 21 Then detective, like I am not cooperating with him, he was 22 like, I am not telling the truth. He was like, If you know 23 something please tell us, whatever. 24 How long after this statement was that? 25

## MI. MATHIS - DIRECT BY MR. FLORCZAK 80 I can't recall. 1 Do you recall how long you were at police 2 3 headquarters? Do you recall what time you got there? I got there had to be like quarter to ten, something like that. 5 Do you know what time you left? 6 7 It was pretty late. Was it midnight, after midnight? Q. 8 After midnight. 9 There came a time when you gave a second statement, is 10 11 that correct? Yes. 12 Α. Do you know what time they took that statement? 13 I can't recall. 14 Marvin, can you tell me how many weeks there are in a 15 year? 16 A. How many weeks in a year? 17 18 Q. Yes. Thirty. 19 Look at this, what has been marked S-40 in evidence. 20 Can you tell me whether you can identify that? 21 That's my initial. Α. 22 Is this the statement you gave? 23 Q. 24 Yes. And has your signature on the last page? 25 Q.

81 MI. MATHIS - DIRECT BY MR. FLORCZAK 1 Α. Yes. Now, do you remember giving a second statement? 2 Q. 3 A. Yes. Do you remember whether he advised you of your rights 4 Q. again? 5 A. No, he didn't. 6 Before they took this written part did they question 7 Q. you again? 8 Yes. 9 Α. Okay. Do you remember being asked in the second 10 11 interview after 5:45: You stated to me in the presence of your mother before the first attempted rubbery and robbery and 12 homicide you intended to rob people with Antwan, is that 13 correct? 14 15 Α. No. And, well, do you recall answering Yes? 16 I don't remember. 17 Α. Is that true? 18 Q. That's not true at all. 19 Did you read this statement before you signed it? 20 I can't recall. 21 Do you remember signing that, if you did read it? 22 Q. I am not for sure. 23 Α. 24 Can you tell us why you signed this paper? They told me to sign, detectives, two detectives. 25 Α.

1

2

3

- Q. Anybody ask you, tell you you wouldn't be able to go home or you would be able to go home, or anything like that?
- A. One detective told me if I made the statement that he would release me to my mother.
- 4 release me to my mother.
- 5 Q. Do you recall which statement?
- 6 A. I believe it was the first statement.
- Q. While you were answering these questions, did you know that you had the right to stop at any time and ask for a
- 9 | lawyer?
- 10 A. No.

14

25

- Q. When you signed that form of your rights, you heard the detective say that it took two minutes to read this and have you and your mother respond to each question, is that
- 15 A. I think so.

about right?

- Q. Did he ask you to read any part of that statement or any part of this?
- 18 A. That part, no.
- 19 Q. Did he ask you to read out loud any part of the 20 statement?
- 21 A. No, he didn't.
- Q. Are there any parts of this statement that you would have trouble reading, do you recall?
- 24 A. Few, at that time.
  - Q. I am talking back in 1996 when you were fifteen.





M. MATHIS - DIRECT BY MR. FLORCZAK

83

- A. Yes, it was, you know, it was a few.
  - Q. I show you what has been marked S-40 in evidence, --
- 3 I withdraw the question.
- 4 MR. FLORCZAK: I have no further questions, your
- 5 Honor, thank you.
- 6 THE COURT: Mr. Kolano.
- 7 | CROSS EXAMINATION BY MR. KOLANO:
- Q. Mr. Mathis, you said you went to the vice-principal's
- 9 office?

1

- 10 A. That's correct.
- Q. Okay. And was this the first time you had been to the
- 12 | vice-principal's office?
- 13 A. I been there twice.
- Q. And on the other occasions were you reprimanded?
- 15 A. No.
- 16 Q. So in and of itself going to vice-principal's office
- 17 | was not a big deal?
- 18 | A. It was no big deal.
- 19 Q. And when you got there there was Detective Garcia?
- 20 A. Yes.
- 21 | Q. How many times had you met Detective Garcia prior to
- 22 | that day?
- 23 A. I met him once.
- 24 Q. How long before that day had you met Detective Garcia?
- 25 A. I can't remember.

M. MATHIS - CROSS BY MR. KOLANO 85 1 Α. Yes. 2 Q. How many times had you met Detective Brown? 3 Α. Onice. And what were the circumstances of that meeting before 4 January 24th, 1996? 5 I can't remember. 6 7 Do you remember how much before the 24th of 1996 that Q. it was that you met Detective Brown? A. I can't remember. 9 On either of these occasions that you can't remember, 10 do you recall if Detective Garcia or Detective Brown mistreated 11 you in any way prior to January 24th, 1996? 12 13 Α. No. 14 Q. You don't remember or they didn't mistreat you? They didn't mistreat me. 15 Would it be fair to say that it was a, was a social 16 connection, if you remember, when I say social, they were just 17 passing breeze, shooting the stuff? 18 They didn't really say too much to me. 19 And you knew that these were police officers assigned 20 to the high schools, right? 21 Not at first. 22 Α. 23 Q. You didn't know that? 24 Α. No.

You knew that before the 24th because you had at least

Q.

M. MATHIS - CROSS BY MR. KOLANO 86 one social meeting with Detective Garcia? 1. 2 Yes. Α. 3 Q. And they were -- they weren't in uniform, right? 4 Α. No. Did you know about their reputation in the school? 5 Q. 6 Α. No. So whatever contact you had was based on your own one 7 Q. time meeting and whatever happened on the 24th of January, 8 1996, right? 9 A. Yes. 10 11 Q. And Detective Garcia asked you if you would go to the police headquarters because there was a homicide investigation? 12 A. He told me that I have to go, he said, because somebody 13 14 called in and said I was a suspect, or whatever. Did he tell you who had called in? 15 A. No, he didn't. 16 And at that time were you placed in handcuffs in the 17 vice-principal's office? 18 No. 19 Α. When they took you through the hall did they put you 20 in handcuffs then? 21 No. 22 Α. When they put you in the car did they put you in 23 Q. 24 handcuffs? 25 Α. No.

|    | М  | . MATHIS - CROSS BY MR. KOLANO 87                      |  |  |  |
|----|--|--|--|--|--|
| 1  | Q.   | When they transported you from the car to              |  |  |  |
| 2  | headqua  | rters, did they put you in handcuffs?                  |  |  |  |
| 3  | A. No.   | · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·                  |  |  |  |
| 4  | Q.   | When you got to headquarters and they walked you up    |  |  |  |
| 5  | the sta  | irs did they put you in handcuffs?                     |  |  |  |
| 6  | A. No.   |  |  |  |  |
| 7  | Q.   | When they put you in the room did they put you in      |  |  |  |
| 8  | handcuf  | ffs?   |  |  |  |
| 9  | A. No.   |  |  |  |  |
| 10 | Q.   | So that basically this entire night you were not in    |  |  |  |
| 11 | handcuf  | fs?  |  |  |  |
| 12 | A. Whe   | en I made a second statement that's when they put the  |  |  |  |
| 13 | handcuffs on me.                                     |  |  |  |  |
| 14 | Q.   | After the second statement?                            |  |  |  |
| 15 | A. Yes   | s, after the second statement.                         |  |  |  |
| 16 | Q.   | And did Detective Garcia tell you that you were placed |  |  |  |
| 17 | under arrest and you were being charged with murder? |  |  |  |  |
| 18 | A. No.   |  |  |  |  |
| 19 | Q •  | Did Detective Brown tell you that?                     |  |  |  |
| 20 | A. No.   |  |  |  |  |
| 21 | Q.   | Did anybody at the high school tell you that you were  |  |  |  |
| 22 | under a  | arrest?  |  |  |  |
| 23 | A. No.   |  |  |  |  |
| 24 | Q.   | And did they search you?                               |  |  |  |
| 25 | A. No.   |  |  |  |  |
|    |  |  |  |  |  |

|    | M.       | MATHIS - CROSS BY MR. KOLANO 88                         |
|----|----------|---|
| 1  | Q.       | Not even a pat down?                                    |
| 2  | A. No.   |   |
| 3  | Q.       | Do you know what a pat down is?                         |
| 4  | A. Yes.  |   |
| 5  | Q.       | What's a pat down?                                      |
| 6  | A. When  | n they check real good to see if you have anything on   |
| 7  | you, wha | atever.   |
| 8  | Q.       | How do you know what a pat down is?                     |
| 9  | A. When  | n officer check you.                                    |
| 10 | Q.       | How do you know? Did it ever happen to you before?      |
| 11 | A. No.   |   |
| 12 | Q.       | Did you have friends that had it happen to them and     |
| 13 | they exp | plained the process to you?                             |
| 14 | A. Yes   |   |
| 15 | Q.       | How many, just give us an idea, how many? A lot of      |
| 16 | your fr  | iends have been patted down before?                     |
| 17 | A. No.   |   |
| 18 | Q.       | Okay. Do you remember who had been patted down and      |
| 19 | told you | this is what a pat down is?                             |
| 20 |          | MR. FLORCZAK: Judge, I would object. Irrelevant.        |
| 21 |          | MR. KOLANO: I would like to be heard at side bar, if    |
| 22 | I need   | to, not to put my reasons in front of the witness, your |
| 23 | Honor.   |   |
| 24 |          | THE COURT: I am going to sustain the objection.         |
| 25 | Q.       | Were you frisked?                                       |
|    |          |   |

|           |     | M. MATHIS - CROSS BY MR. KOLANO 89                             |
|-----------|-----|--|
|           | 1   | A. No.   |
|           | . 2 | Q. When you went to headquarters you indicated that you        |
|           | 3   | were put in a room and you were by yourself?                   |
|           | 4   | A. Yes.  |
|           | 5   | Q. And I think you indicated that a detective came in and      |
|           | 6   | told you basically you were a suspect, he couldn't talk to you |
|           | 7   | now, if you wanted to talk to your mother?                     |
|           | 8   | A. Yes.  |
|           | 9   | Q. And do you know now that was Detective Koczur?              |
|           | 10  | A. Yes.  |
|           | 11  | Q. Person who testified, one of the people who testified       |
|           | 12  | here today?  |
|           | 13  | A. Yes.  |
| William P | 14  | Q. And you heard him basically testify to the same thing       |
|           | 15  | that you said?   |
|           | 16  | A. Yes.  |
|           | 17  | Q. So you would agree with him on that point that he came      |
|           | 18  | in and said, Can't talk to you now, want to wait until your    |
|           | 19  | mother gets here?  |
|           | 20  | A. No, not really. He is the one like trying to get question   |
|           | 21  | out of me.   |
|           | 22  | Q. Koczur?   |
|           | 23  | A. Yes.  |
|           | 24  | Q. Well, who were you referring to early on when you said      |
|           | 25  | that a person came in, told you that we wanted to wait until w |

- 1 can get your mom, and not say anything?
- 2 A. That other detective. I can't remember his name.
- Q. And Detective Koczur you are saying is the one tried
- 4 | to get information out of you?
- 5 A. Correct.
- Q. But you said No, I am not going to talk because other
- 7 | detective said you have to wait until mom was here?
- 8 A. I told him other detective say don't ask me no other
- 9 questions until my mother come.
- 10 Q. And you told, you told Detective Koczur?
- 11 | A. Yes.
- 12 Q. And he stopped at that point?
- 13 A. He just looked at me and shook his head.
- 14 Q. He did stop?
- 15 | A. He did stop.
- 16 Q. So you understood you had a right to basically stop
- 17 | him. All you had to do was Stop, and in fact you did, and he
- 18 | did stop, right?
- 19 A. Correct.
- 20 | Q. Now, at that point in time were you under the
- 21 | influence of drugs or alcohol?
- 22 A. No.
- 23 | Q. So your mind was clear?
- 24 A. Yes.
- 25 Q. And when you were in this room, how long were you in



M. MATHIS - CROSS BY MR. KOLANO 91 this room before the detectives brought you out of the room 1 that you were in? 2 3 A. Can't recall. And they brought you into a conference room? 4 Q. 5 Yes. Α. Q. Bigger room? 6 7 Biger room. Α. Your mom was already there? 8 Q. Yes. 9 Α. And when you saw your mom, she was sitting down? 10 Q. 11 Yes. And there was some other detectives in the room also? Q. 12 13 A. Yes. And they were all kind of dressed in plain clothes, no 14 Q. 15 uniforms? A. No. They had suits on, you know, regular clothes. 16 Okay. Now, I assume since neither you nor your mom 17 Q. testified to it, nobody put a gun to your head that day or hit 18 you or physically hurt you? 19 No. 20 Α. And nobody did anything to threaten your mom or hurt 21 your mom that you saw, right? 22 No. 23 A. 24 And when your mom was there, that's when they went over the rights form with you? 25

M. MATHIS - CROSS BY MR. KOLANO 92 1 No. 2 They talked to you first without going over the rights Q. 3 form? A. Yes. How long did they talk to you before they gave you the 5 6 rights form? A. Say like fifteen, fifteen minutes. 7 Did you think that was strange because they said they Q. wanted to have your mother there before they talked to you? 9 10 A. Yes. 11 Did you tell them the truth in this, the early statement while your mom was there? 12 A. First statement? No. 13 14 First oral statement, first things you are telling the police, did you tell them the truth? 15 A. Not really, no. 16 Did you lie to them? 17 Q. 18 A. Yes.

Okay. What did you lie about in the first oral

So basically you said there were other people who

A. I think I said three other guys two or three other guys

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

Q.

statement?

from Carteret.

A. Correct.

really weren't involved?

M. MATHIS - CROSS BY MR. KOLANO 93 1 That was a lie? 2 Yes. Α. And why did you lie to them? 3 Q. I was scared, I was nervous. 4 5 What were you scared and nervous about? 6 Can't remember. At that point did you tell them that Antwan was the Q. 8 person responsible? Yes. 9 Α. 10 Okay. Right from the beginning you were telling them Antwan, Antwan, Antwan? 11 12 Α. Yes. 13 Did you first deny knowing anything even about the crime? 14 15 Yes. Α. Was that a lie? 16 Q. 17 Yes. Α. 18 Q. Why did you lie? I was scared. 19 Α. How long was it that you told them the lie about not 20 21 knowing anything until you finally said yes, I do know 22 something, but it was some guys from Carteret and Antwan? A. I don't remember. 23 24 Was it, if you can, was it closer to five minutes, tem 25 minutes, or was it more like ten hours?

- M. MATHIS CROSS BY MR. KOLANO
- 1 A. It was like five, five minutes, something like that.
- 2 Q. And the police pretty much right from the beginning
- 3 | said, Your story is not making sense, and you realized that and

- 4 | you told them about the boys from Carteret?
- 5 A. Yes.
- 6 Q. And your mom was there?
- 7 A. I think, yes, she was.
- 8 Q. Did there come a point in time when you wanted your
- 9 | mom to leave?
- 10 A. Yes.
- 11 Q. Why did you want your mom to leave?
- 12 A. I didn't want to get her upset. That's when I was telling
- 13 detective, you know, what really happened at that time, that it
- 14 | wasn't two boys from Carteret.
- 15 Q. And did you do that to basically protect your mom so
- 16 | your mom didn't have to hear you tell the details of this?
- 17 | A. Yes.
- 18 Q. After you told the detectives that, the details, did
- 19 | your mom come back and then did you repeat them in front of
- 20 | your mom?
- 21 A. Yes.
- 22 Q. Did the detectives kind of ease your fears and say,
- 23 Okay, you got it off your chest, now you can say it in front of
- 24 | your mom?
- 25 | A. Yes.





|    | M. MATHIS - CROSS BY MR. KOLANO 96                          |
|----|---|
| 1  | I was they was just saying heights. Five, ten. I am         |
| 2  | not for sure. I just told them.                             |
| 3  | Q. How tall were you at the time?                           |
| 4  | A. Five, six.   |
| 5  | Q. And the height, the weight, hundred seventy pounds,      |
| 6  | was that also a guess or an estimate on your behalf?        |
| 7  | A. Estimate. Yes.   |
| 8  | Q. Okay. But he did have braids at the time, right?         |
| 9  | A. Yes.   |
| 10 | Q. And he did have a beard?                                 |
| 11 | A. Yes.   |
| 12 | Q. And here it says: Yes. But I don't know his name.        |
| 13 | He is from Carteret. Talking about the other person who was |
| 14 | there.  |
| 15 | When you met, when you met him was he with anyone else?     |
| 16 | Answer: Yes. But I don't know his name. He is from          |
| 17 | Carteret.   |
| 18 | Is that accurate?   |
| 19 | A. Yes.   |
| 20 | Q. Okay. Now that you have already told us in the oral      |
| 21 | statement that was kind of a little bit of a lie?           |
| 22 | A. Yes.   |
| 23 | Q. And then you basically repeated that in this first       |
| 24 | written statement?  |
| 25 | A. Yes.   |

M. MATHIS - CROSS BY MR. KOLANO 97 1 And in, in this statement your initials appear on the 2 bottom of each of the pages, right? 3 Yes. 4 And then your signature is at the end, right there? 5 Α. Yes. 6 Okay. That's your mother's signature also? Q. 7 Α. Yes. First statement that's pretty much what you told the 8 Q. 9 police, right? 10 A. Yes. 11 And now, now we know that at least parts of it are a 12 lie, right? Yes. 13 14 Q. And then there came a point in time after this first 15 statement that you told the police that you were wearing, in 16 the statement that you were wearing some black pants? 17 A. Yes. And police asked you where the black pants were. 18 19 A. Yes. 20 And in fact you told them jacket you had on was the Q. jacket you had on when this happened? 21 22 A. Correct. 23 And police took the jacket from you that night? Q. Yes. 24 Α. 25 And they took I think your sneakers? Q.

M. MATHIS - CROSS BY MR. KOLANO 98 1 A. Yes. 2 Q. Black sneakers? 3 Black sneakers, Adidas. 4 But black pants that you had on at the time of the Q. 5 killing were at home, right? 6 Correct. Α. 7 And the police said that they wanted to go to your 8 house to get those, right? 9 A. Yes. 10 And that's when they gave you another piece of paper Q. to sign, and your mother signed, so they could get your black 11 12 pants? 13 Α. No. 14 Q. You don't remember that? 15 No. A. 16 Q. Showing you what is marked S-39. Do you recognize 17 that as being your signature? That's my signature, but I don't remember signing it. 18 19 Q. Okay. But that is your signature? 20 Yes. Α. 21 Now, afterwards, did the police leave you in that room Q. 22 and ask you to look through some books to see if you could identify Antwan? 23 24 Yes. 25 Q. Gave you whole bunch of mug books?

M. MATHIS - CROSS BY MR. KOLANO 99 1 Α. Yes. 2 Were you able to find a picture of Antwan? Q. 3 Not that moment. No. 4 And that's when your mother went to your house? Q. 5 Correct. Α. Okay. And then your mother came back? 6 Q. 7 Yes. And I think you said on direct at that time the police 8 Q. 9 pretty much said, You know, we don't think you are telling us 10 the whole truth; you have some information, would you please tell us? 11 Yes. 12 And that's when the police, that's when you told the 13 Q. 14 police a different version of what happened? 15 Α. Yes. 16 And you told the police that there was nobody from 17 Carteret, right? Yes, I told them. 18 And the other thing that you told them is that you 19 Q. were with Antwan, and that you were with April Diggs? 20 21 Yes. Α. 22 And Renee Diggs? 23 Yes. Α. 24 And in fact it was during the written statement that Q. you mentioned April and Renee. Up until then were you kind of 25

- 1 | keeping their name out of it?
- 2 A. Yes.
- Q. That's because were you being a gentleman and they
- 4 | were girls?
- 5 A. I can't really say.
- Q. Well, was there a reason why you were keeping April's
- 7 | name and Renee's name out of it?
- 8 A. No.
- 9 Q. But then when they came to you during the written
- 10 | statement you said they were walking around and they were
- 11 | pretty much lookout for Antwan?
- 12 | A. Yes.
- 13 Q. Did you tell the police what your involvement was?
- 14 A. Yes.
- 15 Q. What did you tell the police in the second statement
- 16 | what your involvement was?
- 17 | A. I told the detective, he asked me a question, Did I look
- 18 out for cops. I told him, no. I was too scared. Then he told
- 19 | me --
- 20 Q. I am sorry. You have to speak up.
- 21 A. At that time detective asked, asked me what Antwan did.
- 22 | told him that he told, he told me to run across the street,
- 23 look out for cops, and told the other two girls go up the
- 24 | street, ask the man something. Then they just kept on walking.
- 25 | So at that time the two girls, they asked the man a question,



101

- 1 | the man didn't respond to them. Then that's when I stood by,
- 2 | almost close to the Chinese store. That's when Antwan ran
- 3 across the street and told the man to empty his pocket. Man
- 4 | just looked at him. Then Antwan grabbed the man, the man just
- 5 | slapped his hand down, threw a punch. Then the man -- no. Ma
- 6 | threw a punch at Antwan. Antwan threw a punch at the man.
- 7 | Then that's when Antwan pull out the gun, out of his pants, and
- 8 he was about to shoot him -- they was struggling, they was
- 9 struggling like for good two minutes, then that's when I
- 10 | realized they were struggling, that's when I went try to stop
- 11 | the struggle, and gun went off.
- 12 Q. Where were you when the gun went off?
- 13 A. I was close by the Chinese, almost near the Chinese store.
- 14 Q. You said you just went there to stop the struggle and
- 15 gun went off. Were you basically also struggling?
- 16 | A. No.
- 17 Q. Exactly where were you in relationship to Antwan when
- 18 | the gun went off?
- 19 A. I can't remember.
- Q. Do you remember saying at some point in time that you
- 21 had, your hand hit the gun, that's when it went off?
- 22 A. No.
- 23 Q. You don't remember saying that?
- 24 | A. No.

25

Q. Is that true?

M. MATHIS - CROSS BY MR. KOLANO 102. 1 Α. No. Did you -- At that point you ran? 2 Q. 3 Excuse me? Α. 4 Q. At that point you ran? I ran? 5 Α. Q. Yes. 7 Α. Yes. 8 Q. Did you run in the same direction as Antwan? 9 Yes. Did Antwan ask you to go into the man's pockets? 10 Q. Can't remember. 11 12 Do you remember Antwan called you a punk? 13 Yes, yes. Α. 14 Q. Why did Antwan call you a punk? I forgot. I don't remember. 15 16 Was it at about the time or just right after the man got shot he called you a punk? 17 18 Yes, I think so. Α. 19 Q. Would it refresh your recollection if he called you 20 punk because he told you to go into the man's pockets and you 21 said no, he say Ah, you are just a punk? I don't remember. 22 23 Q. Did the girls run in the same direction as you? 24 A. No. 25 Q. They ran in opposite direction?

25

Q.

Didn't seem right?

- 1 A. Didn't seem right. No.
- 2 Q. Did the girls actually go and approach the man to see
- 3 | if he had gold?
- 4 A. Yes.
- 5 Q. Did they come back and report back?
- 6 | A. Yes.
- 7 Q. And did they say the man had gold?
- 8 A. Yes.
- 9 Q. And then Antwan was going to move towards the man, and
- 10 | you told him No?
- 11 | A. Yes.
- 12 Q. He honored your request and stopped?
- 13 | A. Correct.
- 14 Q. Now, was there also some, some Spanish boys or some
- 15 | Puerto Rican boys that Antwan was going to rob?
- 16 | A. Yes.
- 17 | Q. Where does that happen?
- 18 | A. This happened farther down, down the street.
- 19 Q. After the man with the gold chain or before?
- 20 A. This was after.
- 21 | Q. And what did Antwan say he was going to do about
- 22 | robbing them?
- 23 A. He just seen them, you know, they started -- no, first he
- 24 seen them. Right. Then he told April, April and cousin, he
- 25 | said I am going to get this guy. He told me, too. That's when



M. MATHIS - CROSS BY MR. KOLANO 105 he just kept walking fast, and we start walking fast. 1 Then he start running real fast, chased the two Puerto Rican guys. 2 Did he catch them? 3 Q. 4 Α. No. 5 Q. When he said he was going to get this guy what did you understand that to mean? 6 A. What did I understand? 7 8 Yes. Well, did he seem to know the Puerto Rican guys? Q. I don't know. 9 Α. 10 Did he seem to know the guy with the gold chain? I don't know. 11 12 Q. So when he said he was going to get them that was 13 pretty clear he was going to rob them? A. I didn't know what he was going to do. I thought he was 14 going to beat them up, or something. 15 16 Q. For no reason? 17 I don't know. Q. At that time, when he said he was going to get them 18 19 you just assumed he was going to beat them up, and you didn't 20 know why? 21 A. That's what I thought. Yes. 22 Q. Did you, were you curious then as to why it was important whether or not the man had on gold or had chains on, 23

if he was just going to beat him up?

24

25

Α.

No.

106

- Q. Did it make more sense to you, obviously, it was going to be a robbery. That's why if he didn't have gold or chains there would be no reason to hurt him.
- A. No.

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

9

10

- Q. There is at least these two people before the liquor store owner. Was there anybody else that was going to be approached that night?
- 8 A. Excuse me?
  - Q. Was there anybody else that Antwan tried to hurt or rob before the liquor store owner?
- 11 | A. No.
- 12 Q. Was there anything about a deli?
- 13 | A. Yes.
- Q. Please tell us about that.
- A. Well, we approached the deli, and April she noticed the deli. And she told Antwan that, you know, he should rob the deli store. And he told her to peek in in the deli see how many people up in there. So she came back, you know, reported back and told him how many people was there. And he was about to go do it. I told him Don't do it.
  - Q. What was he going to do?
- A. I think he was going to go up there and try to rob the place or something.
- Q. And why did you tell him not to do it?
- 25 A. It wasn't right.

|    | M. MATHIS - CROSS BY MR. KOLANO 107                             |  |  |  |  |
|----|---|--|--|--|--|
| 1  | Q. Now, that's at least two occasions you told him not to       |  |  |  |  |
| 2  | do it and he honored your request right?                        |  |  |  |  |
| 3  | A. Correct.   |  |  |  |  |
| 4  | Q. And the ones with the Puerto Rican boys he just              |  |  |  |  |
| 5  | started running before you even knew what was happening?        |  |  |  |  |
| 6  | A. Yes.   |  |  |  |  |
| 7  | Q. When you get to 709 East Jersey Street, and where the        |  |  |  |  |
| 8  | man from the Portugese liquor store is, why didn't you try to   |  |  |  |  |
| 9  | stop him then?  |  |  |  |  |
| 10 | A. I was, I was scared, I was I don't know. I was too           |  |  |  |  |
| 11 | paranoid.   |  |  |  |  |
| 12 | Q. What were you paranoid about?                                |  |  |  |  |
| 13 | A. The way he just, he was, he was too hyper.                   |  |  |  |  |
| 14 | Q. You think he got hyper because twice you had to              |  |  |  |  |
| 15 | basically rein him in and say Stop, don't do it; it was kind or |  |  |  |  |
| 16 | building up in him?   |  |  |  |  |
| 17 | A. Maybe.   |  |  |  |  |
| 18 | Q. Was he, was he on any drugs that night?                      |  |  |  |  |
| 19 | A. I don't remember.  |  |  |  |  |
| 20 | Q. Were you on any drugs that night?                            |  |  |  |  |
| 21 | A. No.  |  |  |  |  |
| 22 | Q. When I say drugs any marijuana, pot?                         |  |  |  |  |
| 23 | A. No.  |  |  |  |  |
| 24 | Q. How about liquor? Was Antwan drunk?                          |  |  |  |  |
| 25 | Let me Was he drinking?   |  |  |  |  |
|    |   |  |  |  |  |

- 109
- 1 Q. What was your relationship with her at that time?
- 2 A. That was my girlfriend.
- Q. And did you tell her that you might have been involved
- 4 | in something or at least you were present at something?
- 5 A. I told her I was present. Yes.
- 6 Q. When did you tell Sharlama that?
- 7 | A. Just by Jefferson High.
- Q. And that was when you were in school?
- 9 A. Yes.
- 10 Q. And that was in school before the police came and
- 11 | brought you down to principal's office or vice-principal's
- 12 office?
- 13 | A. I don't remember.
- 14 Q. Well, let me ask you this. Did you see Sharlama after
- 15 | the police saw you that day?
- 16 A. I think. Yes. Yes.
- Q. Okay. If I have this straight, police take you to the
- 18 | vice-principal's office, right?
- 19 A. Um-hum. No. This is before.
- 20 Q. So when you talked to Sharlama it was before the
- 21 | police, obviously, because you have been locked up since then?
- 22 A. Yes. Yes.
- 23 Q. Do you remember how soon before it was that you talked
- 24 to Sharlama?
- 25 A. Can't remember, to tell you the truth.



. Well, the shooting happened on the 22nd of January.

110

- 2 You agree with that, right? And it was 24th that you go to
- 3 police headquarters?
- 4 A. 23rd, something like that.
- 5 Q. Because the shooting happens about ten o'clock at
- 6 | night, and you don't see Sharlama that night, right?
- 7 A. No.

- 8 Q. And it's not the 24th, well on the 23rd. You go to
- 9 | school, that would be Tuesday?
- 10 | A. Yes.
- 11 Q. Okay. And is it that time you tell Sharlama you were
- 12 present when the man got killed?
- 13 | A. Yes.
- 14 Q. Did you ask her to say that you were with her?
- 15 A. No.
- 16 Q. You never said to Sharlama: If anybody asks, I was
- 17 | with you between seven and eleven on Monday night?
- 18 A. No. I told her if anyone asks where I was at, tell she
- 19 don't know.
- 20 Q. Is there a reason why you approached her out of the
- 21 | blue to say, If anybody asks, just tell them you don't know?
- 22 A. She approached me.
- Q. Did she say she knew about the, the killing?
- 24 | A. She said she heard some crazy thing happened that night.
- Q. And she heard you were involved?



- 1 A. Yes.
- Q. And she approached you and told you, Hey, I heard you
- 3 | were involved?
- 4 | A. Yes. She pulled me to the side.
- Q. Okay. And then, and then you just told her, Well, if
- 6 anybody asks, you just tell them you don't know where I was?
- 7 A. Correct.
- 8 Q. Did you -- Why did you feel it was important to tell
- 9 her to basically tell the truth?
- 10 A. I have no idea.
- 11 Q. What's your -- What's your relationship with Sharlama
- 12 | now?
- 13 | A. Right now? I haven't heard from her in a while.
- Q. Do you have any animosity towards her?
- 15 A. No.
- 16 Q. Did you ever do anything to hurt her, that you know
- 17 of?
- 18 A. Well, I think so. Yeah.
- Q. Well, was that before this conversation or since this
- 20 | conversation?
- 21 A. Before.
- Q. So basically whatever did you to hurt her, everything
- 23 | was back and okay because you were still together?
- 24 | A. I think so. Yes.
- 25 | Q. Do you know why Sharlama would basically lie and say

112

- 1 | that You said that you wanted her to be your, quote, false
- 2 | alibi?
- 3 A. I don't know.
- Q. As far as you know, you didn't give any reason for Sharlama to lie on you, right?
- A. I don't know if it matter, but I think, you know, she did that because, you know, I kind of cheated on her when I was
  - Q. So basically you think because you cheated on her she would lie about you to the police?

I don't think it matters, or whatever. But, you know.

11 A. Yes.

8

9

- Q. And the same thing -- You have read the discovery, right?
- 14 A. Yes.
- Q. And you know that she, in fact from this hearing and early discovery you know she told the police that you admitted some involvement in this killing, right?
- 18 A. No.
- 19 Q. You didn't read that in Sharlama's statement?
- 20 | A. Oh, in her statement, yes, yes.
- 21 Q. And basically you are saying that's a lie?
- 22 A. Yes.
- Q. And, again, same reason she would tell that lie as far as you know is because you cheated on her?
- 25 A. Yes.

M. MATHIS - CROSS BY MR. KOLANO 113 1 MR. FLORCZAK: Judge, I am going to object. This is 2 going far afield. MR. KOLANO: I will tie it together right now, judge. 3 THE COURT: Go ahead. 4 You knew Sharlama was at police headquarters just 5 Q. before you were there, right? 6 7 A. One of the detectives told me. And the detectives told you that whatever you were 8 Q. telling the police wasn't squaring with what Sharlama had said? 9 10 I don't remember. At some point in time did the detectives tell you that 11 Sharlama said that you admitted your involvement in the crime? 12 13 Α. I don't remember. 14 Now, showing you what is marked S-37, this Miranda, that is your signature, right? 15 Correct. 16 Α. 17 And that is your mother's signature? Q. 18 A. Correct. 19 Q. And these are your initials after each of the rights? 20 Yes. 21 You have the right to remain silent: Do you understand what that means? 22 23 Yes. 24 Okay. Anything you say can and will be used against you in court of law: Do you understand what that means? 25

114

- 1 A. Yes, now I do, yes.
  - Q. You have a right to talk to a lawyer and have him present while you are being questioned: Do you understand what
- 4 that means?
- 5 A. Yes.

2

- Q. And you cannot afford -- If you cannot afford a lawyer, a lawyer, one will be appointed to represent you before any questioning, if you wish: Do you understand this?
- 9 A. Yes, now I do.
- Q. And you can decide at any time to exercise these
  rights and not answer any questions or make any statements: Do
  you understand that?
- 13 A. Yes, now I do.
- Q. Back then what didn't you understand?
- 15 Let's go through it all over.
- You have a right to remain silent. Did you understand that at that point in time?
- 18 A. Yes.
- Q. I mean, that's as simple as it can be: You can keep your mouth shut. You knew that, right?
- 21 A. Yes.
- Q. And anything you say can and will be used against you
- in a court of law: And you understood that right, because
- 24 | that's also very simple?
- 25 A. Yes.



| M. MATHIS - CROSS BY MR. KOL | М. | MATHIS | _ | CROSS | BY | MR. | KOTA | NC |
|------------------------------|----|--------|---|-------|----|-----|------|----|
|------------------------------|----|--------|---|-------|----|-----|------|----|

- 115
- Q. If you say something police are going to use it against you, right?
- 3 A. Yes.

1

- Q. You have a right to talk to a lawyer and have him present while you are being questioned.
- 6 You knew what a lawyer was?
- A. Yes. I, at that time I didn't know I could have had a lawyer present, you know, I didn't know that.
- 9 Q. Did you think you could have a lawyer only later on?
- 10 A. Like on in the future. Yes.
- 11 Q. But in terms of present, you didn't understand that?
- 12 A. I didn't understand.
- Q. Was it the word "present" that you didn't understand?
- 14 A. Sort of.
- Q. All right. So when they read this to you: You have a
- 16 | right to talk to a lawyer, you understood that up to that
- 17 | point, right?
- 18 A. Yes.
- 19 Q. And have him present while you were being questioned.
- 20 | Okay. You understand while you are being questioned, right?
- 21 A. Yes.
- Q. And have him, you understood?
- 23 A. Right.
- Q. So "present" was the only word you didn't understand?
- 25 A. Yes.

M. MATHIS - CROSS BY MR. KOLANO 116 1 And your mother was there at this time? Q. 2 Yes. Α. And she, she understood what "present" means, right? 3 Q. 4 Α. Yes. 5 MR. FLORCZAK: Objection. 6 THE COURT: Sustained. 7 MR. FLORCZAK: He can't testify. 8 Did your mother ever use the word "present" to you? Q. A. Can't recall. 9 10 Never Are you present, Are you present? 11 No, I can't recall. 12 Let me ask you this. When you went to school did the teacher ever say, Please raise your hand if you are present. 13 14 I don't remember. I don't know. A. 15 Never heard the phrase "All present and accounted Q. 16 for"? 17 A. Yes, I heard of it. Yes. Q. Did you know what it meant, all here; present; all 18 19 here? 20 A. Uh-hum. If you cannot afford to hire a lawyer one will be 21 appointed to represent you before any questioning if you wish: 22 Did you understand that back then? 23 No. 24 A. 25 Q. What didn't you understand?

|    | M. MATHIS - CROSS BY MR. KOLANO 117                            |
|----|--|
| 1  | A. The part, "if you wish," I didn't understand.               |
| 2  | Q. "If you wish" you didn't understand?                        |
| 3  | A. Yes.  |
| 4  | Q. Did you ever make a wish prior to that time?                |
| 5  | A. I don't remember.   |
| 6  | Q. You didn't know what the word "wish" means?                 |
| 7  | A. I know what it mean, but, you know, (pause).                |
| 8  | Q. Did you tell the detectives that you didn't understan       |
| 9  | any of these words?  |
| 10 | A. No.   |
| 11 | Q. Did you ask them to explain anything to you?                |
| 12 | A. No.   |
| 13 | THE COURT: Mr. Kolano, I am going to interrupt at              |
| 14 | this time. We have come to the time for lunch recess. So we    |
| 15 | will resume this hearing.                                      |
| 16 | As I indicated, we will be commencing jury selection           |
| 17 | this afternoon using Judge Triarsi's courtroom. So when we     |
| 18 | return, when we resume at 1:30, it will be over there at Judge |
| 19 | Triarsi's.   |
| 20 | (Luncheon Recess).   |
| 21 |  |
| 22 |  |
| 23 | ·  |
| 24 |  |
| 25 |  |
| Į. | ,  |

CERTIFICATE I, B. PETER SLUSAREK, C.S.R., License No. XI00291, an Official Court Reporter of the State of New Jersey, do hereby certify the foregoing to be prepared in full compliance with the current Transcript Format for Judicial Proceedings and is a true and accurate non-compressed transcript to the best of my knowledge and ability. Date: March -5, 1999. B. PETER SLUSAREK, C.S.R., XIOO291 Official Court Reporter Union County Courthouse, Elizabeth, New Jersey,